Natural Disasters: Rebuilding Nations, Aceh Case

SURAIYA KAMARUZZAMAN
Founder and Chairperson, Flower Aceh
Director Aceh Women Trust Fund

Expert Group Meeting
Financing for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women, Oslo, 4 – 7 Sept 2007
Asia Devastated By Quake, Tsunami
Flower Aceh Office, before and after tsunami:
Foto by Suraiya
Aceh in tsunami aftermath
Foto by Ratna, Suraiya n Titi
* Total population: 4,297,485
* 131,000 death
* 37,000 persons are missing
* 550,000 persons displaced

Foto by Ratna n Titi
- 120,000 units of houses destroyed
- 152,000 units of houses partly destroyed (mostly more than 50%)
- 2,260 bridges destroyed and can not be used
- 1,360 km roads in villages destroyed and cannot be used
- 603 km main roads destroyed and cannot be used
- 654 km roads in towns/cities destroyed and cannot be used
- 90% of the Aceh provincial government cannot function
  - In Banda Aceh (capital of the province reduced up to 20%)
- 2,135 school building destroyed partially or totally
- 2,500 teachers and non teachers were died
- 150,000 pupils lost their education facilities
- 690 hospital destroyed
- Death of thousands of paramedic

Source: Cut Hasniati, Aceh Reconstruction and Recovery Agency, September 2005
Why we should be focusing on a gender perspective of the tsunami?

- Women and men experience the same hardship” replied Kofi Anan to a question on women’s specific need in the tsunami aftermath, at the press conference during his visit to Jakarta in January 2005
- But women have specific need
- Our research (Flower Aceh n Women Solidarity organization) has extended to 14 camps, showing the same patterns of survival. Research in 8 camps in Banda Aceh (7-17 Jan 2005): among survivors aged 18-55 – number of males are at least double number of females
- Need serious consideration
Data:

- Mesjid Alfaizin (Lampeuneurut): 698 males, 210 females
- Aceh Jaya (Lampeuneurut): 516 males, 203 females
- Gedung Sosial: 635 males, 274 females
- Neheun: 761 males, 358 females
- Cot Gue: 259 males, 83 females
- DPRD Tingkat Satu: 283 males, 104 females
- TVRI: 881 males, 189 females
- Seubon Ayon (Lhoknga): 240 males, 138 females
- Data from sub-district – Lampuuk (8 Jan 2005): Total inhabitants of 5 villages: 5,500. Survivors: 750 persons, only 40 females: Mesjid Village: 15 females; Cut Village: 1 female; Blang Village: 10 females; Lambaro Village: 7 females; Balee Village: 10 females
The demography changed and there is imbalance between the number of man and women, the serious consideration must be made:

- How to design safe camp for women as minority among men as majority?
- Ensuring that women have access to the family fund in bank, husband’s pension, inheritance, land right, information etc?
- The existing women must be involved in the decision making process to recover their home town.
- Regarding the “domestic job” (read: serving the family) which has been titled as main job of women. The reducing of women will consequence into work volume to serve family (husband, son, brother, uncle, father in law)
Women’s response:

- There are many of spontaneous action by women, especially who live in barrack/camp or live in their family as refugee
- Involving in various meeting for designing discussing Aceh reconstruction process and suggesting women perspective
- Women Consultative Meeting, April 4, 2005
- Province Women Empowerment Bureau, forming Gender Working Group (GWG), and held regular biweekly meeting as the central of monitoring of policy during reconciliation, reconstruction and rehabilitation process in Aceh, to ensure of include gender perspective in all respects.
- Establish Aceh Women Trust Fund
Women’s response

- Women’s Crisis Centre
- Land rights
- Women capacity building, by training/workshop/comparison study, organizing women on the grass root, developing psychosocial program, community economical development.
- One of the big agenda and monumental step is conducting 2\textsuperscript{nd} Acehnese Women Congress (Duk Pakat Inong Aceh – II), held on 16\textsuperscript{th}-19\textsuperscript{th} June 2005, attended by 400 women cross-sector, geography, race and religion. The congress initialed by one day seminar and one of the key issue “Recovery in the wide meaning for women and the involvement of Aceh Reconstruction and Recovery”.
DPIA – II aimed to bring up all problem and women interest in which has been ignoring since long time. Women will be involving in resolving Aceh conflict. Arising understanding, realizing and to educate the urgency of women involvement on reconstruction and recovery process in NAD; Identifying Acehnese women problems and interest for the fair Aceh reconstruction; Stressing Acehnese women role and function as political, economical and social power for the future of glorious Aceh; Supporting acehnese women community to participate in the development in their own area to achieve clean and goon governance, strengthening women unity in Nanggrooe Aceh Darussalam, without colouring the different of race, religion/belief, class and economical level.
Women Response
Foto: Women Response
Estimation for post tsunami budget:

Indonesia: **USD 6.5 billion** until 2009 (assessment by ADB, Indonesia Government, World Bank, UN and other agencies)

Implementation: Multi Donor Trust Fund

• 1995: USD 650 million of pledges from 15 bilateral and multi-lateral donors (*European Commission, Netherlands, United Kingdom, World Bank, Sweden, Denmark, Norway, Canada, Asian Development Bank, United States, Germany, Belgium, Finland, New Zealand and Ireland*)
Multi Donor Trust Fund

- Manages a portfolio of 17 projects valued at USD 713 million with USD 482 million from the Multi Donor Fund and another USD 231 million from the Government’s Coordinating Agency for the Rehabilitation and Reconstruction of Aceh and Nias (BRR).

- December 2006 four donors (the Netherlands, United Kingdom, Sweden, and Germany) have pledged an additional $110 million to the Multi Donor Fund.
Increasing debt in tsunami aftermath

- New loan from CGI (*Consultative Group on Indonesia*) for 2005 of USD 3.4 billion, including USD 1.7 billion for recovery of Aceh and North Sumatra.

- USD 2.8 billion disbursed through state budget and USD 600 million directly to NGO's (no information on which NGO's)
Gender biased on Planning and Implementation.

- BRR-Aceh Nias (Reconstruction and Recovery Body for Aceh-Nias). Staffing composition:
  - Total 1,219 staff, 145 women (11.9%).
  - Decision Maker staff: 281 staff, 12 women (4%).
- Major of BRR staff has no comprehensive understanding on gender mainstreaming. This case impacted to the minimum understanding above experience specific women which can be part in policy execution of BRR program.
- Gender Budgeting NOT WELL IMPLEMENTED on BRR's Budget.
- Women and Children Directorate has budget IDR 32.6 billion equivalent to 0.82% of Total budget IDR 3.9 trillion 2005. Only 16% of IDR 32.6 billions implemented.
- Comparable to military defense 2006, 7.19%
- Women and Children directorate has budget 0.045% of IDR 10.5 Trillion 2006, 80% implemented.
- NAD APBD 2006, only 0.16% targeted for women sector.
Gender biased on planning and implementation, Sources: 2006 GWG women situation evaluation.

- Major of international institution involving on Aceh rehabilitation and reconstruction process has not implemented gender mainstreaming. Seldom using assorted data, aid frequently not gender initiative and wrong target.
- Average presentation women involving in the village meeting and housing building: 21 – 40%. In which 50% of the presents are active.
- House ownership also frequently disadvantaged women, due to not stated women name as the owner, including women family head.
- Post tsunami women work on the town 36% and in rural 45%. Women’s work/labour are acknowledged as supplementary to their husbands, and therefore women are paid less than men or unpaid.
- Supports and aids given after tsunami by most of NGO's and government institutions usually do not have exit strategies and sustainability for beneficiaries, supporting the gender stereotyping of women’s economic roles (ie, women given shewing machine, even has no shewing skill and ignoring beneficiary potential) and create dependency of the beneficiaries.

- Aceh women mortality because bearing baby 307 person of 100,000 maternity and baby mortality 35 of 1000 birth. Early 2006 Aceh Recovery Forum noted 134 baby and 54 Mother died by maternity in displacement.

- Reports on condition of Women IDP's in Aceh from the monitoring special rapporteur for Aceh of women national committee from Oct 2005 up to Feb 2006 found 28 case discrimination in 59 displacement on 15 district, 146 case hardness in displacement, 108 of the sexual harassment case.
Fact Sheet, (source: 2006 Budget Tracking, GeRAK, TIFA.)

- 1,710 unit house among 22,291 house, are built under specification.
- 50 unit house are fictive.
- 752 unit built mis-location
- 407 unit house delivered to wrong target
- 190 unit house facilitated under specification.
Gerak Note 2006:

- IDR 5.8 Trillion managed Bakornas PB (national tsunami emergency response), indicate to be corrupted.
- IDR 114,5 Billion for barrack building indicated corrupted.
- IDR 19 Billion for daily live of survival at Seumeule island indicated corrupted.
- IDR 57 Billion for heavy equipment by BRR Aceh – Nias, indicated corrupted.
- Sub-Contracting method (PT Waskita karya accepted contract from Turki Red Cross sub-contracted to PT Ahmahdali) Caused the down spec of housing unit.
- Low Quality of housing unit build by BRR, Save the Children, Oxfam, FIG – German, Real Estate Indonesia and Serasih Indonesia.
Execution Practice Reconstruction and Recovery (Gerak “Budget Tracking Rehap Recon in Aceh”, 2006)

- Among 59 projects (housing, livelihood, education, health, and infrastructure) found 35 projects or 59.32% project reconstruction and recovery on problems (mark up, wrong target, sub-contracting, corrupted, under specification, illegal collection fee, illegal deductible), meanwhile 24 projects (40.68%) relatively good.
- 47.46% project not on schedule, meanwhile 52.54% project on schedule.
- Beneficiary involvement reconstruction and recovery: 47.5% or 28 projects involved in the beginning, 20.34% or 12 projects no people involved, 13.56% or 8 projects involved since beginning to end, 11.86% or 7 projects involved in the execution only, 6.78% or 4 projects involved on the final stage only.
- 74.58% or 44 projects executed without public transparency.
- 62.71% beneficiary declared unsatisfied toward execution reconstruction and recovery, 30.51% satisfied, etc 6.78%.
- Note: 32 projects from state budget and 27 non state budget.
Other point must be fully paid attention by all stake holder involving in Aceh reconstruction and recovery

- Cash for work became cash for “Everything”? 
- Aceh become the arena of contest the existence of many institution involving on reconstruction and recovery, i.e claim on work area, jumbo banner in everywhere 
- The 1st n 2nd years after tsunami, fast traffic of “expert” rotation, difficulting coordination between local NGO and the International NGO due to new expert will have new policy and wasting the time and energy 
- The 1st n 2nd years after tsunami, Big car syndrome become the barikade and border show the different living standard level between local person (who need help) and “comer” who coming for helping.
**Recommendation:**

- Donor institutions for Aceh (natural disaster area or post conflict), ensuring minimum 40% total budget focused for women related issue.

- Donors need to ensure equal access to psychosocial support (included livelihood training), health care, education for all women and men.

- International community should; committed to give its support based on the actual need, human rights and empowering principles.

- Housing sector: ensure security, comfort, respect to human dignity with women and children friendly awareness.

- Supporting women to take opportunity to play important role in strategic position in the province, district, sub-district and village level.

- Listen women voice and support for women movement
Recommendation:

- Acehnese women should improve their capacity in order to be able to actively participate in the development process and maintaining a sustainability peace.
- To reduce corruption, independent auditor and civil society involvement on monitoring should be involved.