United Nations
Division for the Advancement of Women (DAW)
Expert Group Meeting
Enhancing Participation of Women in Development
through an Enabling Environment
for Achieving Gender Equality and
the Advancement of Women
Bangkok, Thailand, 8-11 November 2005

Decent work and gender equality:
participation of women workers in
development frameworks*

Prepared by

Margarita Zambrano

* The views expressed in this paper are those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the United Nations
The paper reviews forms of participation in the analysis of PRSP processes of twelve countries, a scrutiny of their employment policies, and offers some suggestions for the creation of enabling conditions to contribute towards achieving gender equality and the advancement of women in the framework of poverty reduction strategies. They place emphasis on the creation of mechanisms and resources for ensuring participation, redressing gender inequality in the division of labour, improving sensitivity and political will to warrant and support participation from women workers in informal employment, and supporting organization, networking and bargaining.

1 The PRSP: Participation of poor women?

Participation of the poor is regarded as a necessary condition for financial lending to the poorest countries. In this alternative approach to poverty reduction, poverty is a result of social exclusion, inequality in distribution of resources, assets and opportunities, and of deprivation of fundamental rights and freedoms. The decent work agenda offers a parallel understanding of development. It recognizes the interrelation of structural (i.e. the global economy, employment opportunities, working conditions, social protection and representation based on respect for fundamental principles and rights at work), and human development (i.e. peoples’ own expectations be it paid or unpaid work in the formal or informal economy). Thus, social dialogue as a strategic objective of decent work – being the other defence of fundamental principles and rights at work, access to employment and social security, and, social protection, is a fitting terrain to facilitate equitable forms of negotiation, consultation, or simply the exchange of information between, or among, the representatives of governments, employers and workers, on issues of mutual interest relating to economic and social policy (1).

Insofar as poverty is multidimensional in nature and affects a wide range of human capabilities, participatory poverty assessments are critical to examine other development attributes (vulnerability, powerlessness, voicelessness and governance systems where women have been absent or where the rules conform to a male standard). But participatory poverty assessments are also opportunities to learn about differences between women and men on time allocated to tasks and activities in the course of everyday life. Thus, gender analysis can explain differences in status, conditions and outcomes in many areas of work and productivity, the risk of becoming or remaining poor or on the chances of escaping poverty. Other social categories such as age, ethnicity/religion, culture, location, and occupational status and type of household, including vulnerable and socially excluded groups – indigenous, refugees or displaced, minority and socially excluded, street children, the disabled, and persons living with HIV/AIDS, complement a refined analysis.

Social dialogue plays a pivotal role in identifying the important labour issues and in realising fundamental principles and rights at work promoted by the ILO. Therefore,

---

1 InFocus Programme: Strengthen social dialogue so all voices can be heard. International Labour Organization, Geneva, 2000.
social dialogue is relevant to PRSP preparation, both as an input into the consultative process, showing that employers’ and workers’ organizations can contribute to programme design, and as a continuing source of proposals to improve labour market functioning through consensus and negotiation. This process is itself an opportunity to disentangle sources of inequality, to learn about duties, rights and entitlements and to assign responsibilities i.e. ownership.

However, the basic criteria that lies at the centre of the PRSPs’ approach to poverty reduction, that of participation, does not take into account time and constraints of women workers, in particular, the greater number, those who are in informal employment. Therefore, they are left out of the process.

In order to ascertain participation of women and men into the consultative stages of the formulation of PRSP in twelve countries\(^2\), and the characteristics of proposals for addressing gender inequality in the world of labour, a review of PRSPs in twelve countries\(^3\) was undertaken along two lines: a) Engagement of international agencies, the World Bank, ILO, workers, employers and government officials from ministries of labour, and civil society (donor countries, social movements, non governmental organizations of different types), and the representation of women and men from within the state (positioned in bureaucracies, formalized structures for gender equality or institutional frameworks); and b) whether such participation had engendered employment policies and their attention to gender needs and interest in the world of labour. Different sources of information were analyzed,\(^4\) and the period analyzed was that of December 1999 to September 2002.

PRSP consultations were integrated in public debates and seminars (Guinea Bissau, Mozambique, Mali, Honduras). “Mass” organizations (Mali, Lao PDR), Participatory Citizens Commission\(^5\), cooperatives and peasant movements (Honduras)\(^6\) academic institutions (Higher Institute of Training and Applied Research (ISFRA) of the University of Mali, April-May 2001), NGOs specialized in institutional research (Strategic Partnerships in Africa), and organised NGO Forums (Bolivia, Jubilee Forum, 2000; Cambodia NGO Forum, 2001). The largest participation, very often through institutional mechanisms (Tanzania\(^7\), Honduras\(^8\)), came from individual members and associations of small business, micro-enterprises, and employers. Unions or workers’ groups were absent. There was no indication that poor women were participants on a same footing

\(^2\) At the time twelve countries were preparing or in the process of finalizing their PRSPS: Bolivia, Cambodia, Ethiopia, Guinea Bissau, Lao People’s Democratic Republic, Honduras, Mali, Mozambique, Nepal, Sri Lanka, Tanzania, and Vietnam.


\(^4\) Sources of information included: World Bank Poverty Newsletters, Interim and Final official PRSPs of the countries above mentioned; Joint Staff Assessment papers of the World Bank, research papers and external reviews publicized by donors, international agencies and reports from the International Labour Organization (ILO).

\(^5\) In Honduras: FONAC (National Convergence Forum), Interforos (NGO network), AMHON (The Honduran Association of Municipalities).

\(^6\) Joint Staffs Assessment, September 17 2001.

\(^7\) The Tanzania Business Council

\(^8\) FOPRODEH (The Honduran Federation of Private Development Organizations), and the Chamber of Commerce of Tegucigalpa
with men from the attending groups. Notwithstanding, the PRSP in Honduras referred to the large numbers of female street vendors, foresaw the need to conduct surveys and to clarify the economic features of this sector assigning importance to gender relations. Workers’ organizations in particular, and those comprising the majority of the poor, i.e. those in the informal economy did not participate either as segments of civil society or the “private sector”.

PRSPs therefore lacked information on issues of concern for unions, and most importantly, were silent on pervasive deficits on the equality of opportunity and treatment to women workers, women’s unions or branches of women in trade unions and access to decision making. Only two women’s branches, the Lao Women’s Union (LWU) and the Women’s Union in Vietnam were reportedly involved. The first combines work on health and education at the grassroots level to promote income generating activities and economic activities in productive sectors such as livestock, fishponds and cottage industries. The second one, in Vietnam, partnered with the National Committee for the Advancement of Women (NCFAW) in consultations and had representatives in the drafting committee. In some PRSP countries concern and frustration expressed by workers underscored two elements that hamper participation, dialogue, or reaching consensus: considerable restrictions on the freedom of workers and employers to associate and form or join organizations of their own choosing in PRSP countries, and insufficient access to key relevant groups.

What did we learn about strategies to achieve decent work with gender equality? The findings reveal that analysis of the situation of women was often limited to a few sectors such as health and education where gender inequalities are compounded with women’s specific issues. The discussion on gender generally referred to women’s issues. PRSPs rarely pointed out gender-based discrimination or gender asymmetrical relations except for one case where the PRSP reported that one-sixth of the focus groups identified gender discrimination as an obstacle to poverty reduction. Analysis of problems and constraints experienced by poor men arising from societal expectations, norms and regulations were also absent. No reference was found on the lack of accountability of laws to the rights of women. Poor women who are disproportionately engaged in the informal sector without benefits and security, and undertaking risky and dangerous occupations are more vulnerable to violence. And violence against women also affects the community as a whole. Furthermore, power relationships contributing to the distribution of resources, opportunities and constraints were not analysed.

Promotion of economic growth thorough employment is a critical objective stated for most PRSPs since it is assumed that economic growth automatically generates job opportunities. However, little attention is paid to the quantity and quality of employment generated. Gender biases are manifested in the definition of work confined to remunerated work, thereby excluding the many women who engage in unpaid household work.

---

9 Especially in regard to customary ownership of property, wage employment and decision-making at the national and household levels. Focus groups made up by women also raised concerns about male alcoholism.
work. The lack of recognition to women’s unpaid labour and its direct contribution to the market economy is staggering. Indicators most commonly used were the unemployment rate, the total employment or number of small and micro-enterprises. These indicators refer to formal employment only, leaving out workers in the informal economy, the majority of the poor un-protected and under-compensated. The primary focus is either the enterprise (e.g., Small and Medium Enterprises, SMEs), a specific sector (e.g., tourism or agro-processing) or the amount produced, not the employment outcomes themselves. Only in one country, Viet Nam, the strategy includes an explicit target for women’s employment: by 2010, half of all new jobs in Viet Nam should be held by women.

Analyses of sectors where women contribute largely to the economy were treated without any reference to the totality of women’s work, particularly, women’s unpaid care work. The PRSP for Honduras shows the large percentage of market for female and male labour in maquila employment, a 70%, the largest number in Central America (Fernandez, 2002)\(^\text{10}\). It is expected that this percentage, equivalent to 30% in 1997, will double by the year 2007 (Thijs, 1997, cited in Fernandez). PRSPs did not anticipate the impact of these changes to the new circumstances of women’s increased labour force participation including protection in the work place and entitlements to state support and guarantees of basic incomes and other benefits. Little attention was given to the non-wage benefits of employment, including unemployment insurance, sickness benefits and pensions. The question of how such economic participation comes together with social security and access to social services, such as transport, health, education, training, and childcare facilities\(^\text{11}\) as critical as the demand for fair wages was not posed.

Examination of the productive and economic role of women was performed in relationship to the development of financial markets, the promotion of self-employment, small enterprises, credit for business development, and the expansion of the micro-enterprise sector\(^\text{12}\). This analysis does not contemplate upgrading paying or competitive skill-sets, or transforming the economic environment in order for poor women to benefit. This has broad implications for the strategies’ ability to address feminised poverty, and particularly severe consequences for the PRSPs’ ability to address issues of women’s access to employment, access to health care and education, and improving opportunities to exert influence in society. None of the PRPSs present a coherent, integrated strategy for tackling the problems of employment identified.

PRSPs aim to increase the productive capacity of women, education being the key element to raise productivity and income\(^\text{13}\), including affirmative measures in non-traditional sectors. Micro-interventions, especially in forms such as co-operative credit

---


\(^\text{11}\) The creation of the maquila factories in Honduras has not been accompanied with the necessary infrastructure, and there is consensus that both the working and the employment conditions are precarious.

\(^\text{12}\) An exception is the I-Mozambique that proposes self-employment, vocational training, and social security for all workers irrespective of the sector and the size of their employer.

\(^\text{13}\) PRSP Bolivia, I-Guinea Bissau, I-Mozambique
schemes\textsuperscript{14}, were promoted, and also programmes to improve the role of women in management. But, a focus on education and life expectancy only fails to consider the economic aspects of women’s well being, including employment, unemployment, wages, and access to social safety nets which are part of a broader economic environment. Changes in labour markets and the demand for women’s labour by employers who tend to see labour in gender-specific ways, are influenced by inequality of opportunities in specific social and cultural contexts even within the same country. Promotion of entrepreneurship of women needs to contrast market and legal constraints, with those experienced by men-owned businesses in the same sectors. It is recognised that training should be accompanied with opportunities to develop a broader range of competencies including networking, sound management, marketing and negotiating abilities. Women’s lower educational attainments and intermittent career paths are not, contrary to conventional belief, the main reason for gender differentials in pay (ILO, 2003)\textsuperscript{15}. Other factors such as occupational segregation, biased pay structures and job classification systems, and decentralized or weak collective bargaining, appear to be more important determinants of inequalities in pay; stereotyping, gender norms and cultural conventions, i.e. gender expected roles that dictate that a woman’s place is in the home, as mother and housewife. Women continue with higher responsibilities respect to domestic, community and child rearing domains; men have higher responsibilities in public and productive activities. Strict segregation and early pregnancy are also major barriers. Therefore, education and training are important, but supportive measures such as more active equality-enhancing measures in the labour market are required.

Improvement of women’s paid work did not include promotion of men taking up care-giving responsibilities. Securing women’s economic independence, empowering women and ending unequal burdens of work requires a strategy of “equality in difference” in that women’s “traditional” domestic and care-giving activities are valued. Finding available options for women and men when they cannot work for pay is important, particularly if they are engaged in periods of care giving, such as in countries with large number of HIV-AIDS cases. This policy issue was not addressed by any PRSP.

The protection of core labour rights of women and men was also absent in all PRSPs. The large majority of poor women and poor men are landless rural workers, small tenant farmers, small traders or producers who are frequently excluded from laws providing for the legal establishment of employers’ and workers’ organizations or protecting such organizations and their members from acts of intimidation and violence. The fundamental security rights encompassed by labour standards, i.e. the right to free association, the right to collective representation, and the right to free expression of grievances (Portes, 1994)\textsuperscript{16} were left out of the strategies.

\textsuperscript{14} I-PRSP Mozambique, PRSP Bolivia
Creation of laws against discrimination was the most common strategy proposed to combat gender inequity. Among them we found laws against family violence, sexual harassment, protecting the rights of indigenous peoples, amendments to the Electoral Code, to laws on political parties and to labour laws, or regulations and reforms to property laws, or agrarian reform. Other measures are critical. Learning about equality of opportunity and treatment of women and men from provisions in the Labour or Family Code, human rights education or accountability to the protection and promotion of the rights of women are critical to redress gender biases and gender discrimination. Lack of education about women’s rights, inequity in the application of fundamental conventions, e.g. CEDAW, impinge upon their ability to apply their entitlements.

2 Why is women’s participation in the PRSP process critical in formulating a decent work agenda?

Women are critical agents of development at a time of great change, but their contributions have not led to their social and economic empowerment. Bearing in mind insufficiencies in the measurement of productive, remunerated and no-remunerated work by sex, data available suggests that in the poorest regions of the world, the share of female family workers in total employment is much higher than men’s, and women’s are less likely to be wage and salaried workers (ILO, 2004)\(^{17}\). In the year 2000 women comprised 41 per cent of the paid labour force worldwide\(^{18}\). Regionally, their contribution (in the age range of 20 to 54 years) was also significant: 58% in Africa, 64% in Asia, 46% in Latin America and the Caribbean, 69 % in Europe, and 73 % in North America\(^{19}\). This increase has not been accompanied by improvements in their employment status and working conditions.

Regular full-time wage employment has given way to a broad range of other forms of labour such as outsourcing; contract labour, home-based work, part time work and self-employment. These forms are associated with a rise of the informal economy. The informal economy, which represents a higher source of employment for women than for men, has absorbed up to eight or nine out of every ten entrants to the labour market of developing countries (Chen, Lund, and Jhbavala, 2002)\(^{20}\). According to an ILO Report (ILO, 2002)\(^{21}\) more women than men occupy low-paid and the least secure jobs. Their access and control over productive resources is more difficult. Women have fewer opportunities to obtain training, to advance their career and to be promoted. Unemployment rates have almost always been higher for women than men. In most parts of the world, women have access to higher education but they also have more difficulties in finding employment. The number of women in decision-making positions is extremely low. Women hold 1 to 3 per cent of top executive jobs in the private sector and trade unions. At the level of the household and the community, women have the primary responsibility for caring and domestic work. Women’s unpaid agricultural work and housework, which accounts for about one-third of the world’s economic production,

\(^{21}\) International Labour Organization. Decent Work and the Informal Economy, ibid
continue to be devalued, under rewarded and unprotected. Also, women’s efforts to gain independence and run their own businesses encounter obstacles when compared to the efforts of their male counterparts. Poverty is also related to social exclusion from institutions or organizations to enable them to voice their needs and gender specific interests. The link between the informal economy and being poor is more prevalent for women than for men. A higher percentage of women than men work in the informal economy. Women are also concentrated in the lower-income segments of the informal economy—in survival activities or as casual wagemakers or home-workers. In the higher segments, women tend to be in smaller scale operations with less growth potential, as compared to those operated by men.

Analysis over time and across societies and cultures tends to show that women more than men are negatively affected. Within different contexts, gender inequality is likely to be interrelated with other forms of inequality, both between diverse households and groups in a society (such as race, class and ethnicity) as well as those internal to households (such as age, marital status, sexual orientation and physical ability). As a result, men and women are socially differentiated, rather than homogeneous.

The rise in numbers of the working poor of the world—those who work but do not earn enough to lift themselves and their families above the USD 1 a day poverty line, cannot be separated from the analysis of gender inequality. Out of the 550 million working poor of the world, an estimated 330 million or about 60 per cent are women. The causes and depth of female poverty are certainly multiple, but an understanding of the experiences and conditions of women vis-à-vis men shows that poverty is related to women’s lack of access and control of resources such as land, credits, decision making and reproductive and sexual health and rights. The interrelationships between economic independence, health, education and general well being are obvious.

In Latin America and the Caribbean, transformations in the labour market and women’s educational achievements have not been matched by changes in the distribution of family responsibilities. This places the region on an equal footing with other regions where women have the primary responsibility for unpaid household work and care-giving activities. In Mexico, for example, the proportion of women who perform household activities is greater than the proportion of men, and women spend more time on such activities than men. Educational practices very often create a divide between reproductive and economic choices, between paid and unpaid labour, between low and high status careers. Up to date, the lack of an encompassing perspective—that of lifelong learning, which calls for the preparation of people to deal with problems and to manage multiple roles and responsibilities, is also another factor. The knowledge and skills that it is often assumed women possess, mostly used in the domestic sphere—non-technical instrumental competencies, receive lesser social value and are not remunerated in the labour market. The division of labour expressed in the overload of work with no social or

---


23 Instituto Nacional de Estadística, Geografía e Informática (INEGI), 2002, “Encuesta nacional sobre uso del tiempo”, México, D.F.
economic value, lack of time available for training or recreation, and the deficient access to information systems restrict the opportunities to enhance women’s earning capacities, their participation in social and political life and decision-making, and the possibility of living fulfilling lives. Women higher responsibilities in the domestic, community and child rearing domains and the unequal division of labour, make it difficult for women to balance their productive and reproductive roles. This involves the emergence of new identities, new life styles, and a reconfiguration of men and women in public and private matters and the corresponding gender relationships. Women’s ability to act as fully fledged agents therefore depends as much on access to the process, particularly to decision-making, as on the value and legitimacy given to their contributions on an equal footing as workers and citizens.

3 Recommendations for Action

The state continues to be an arena of institutional decisions to set the parameters of citizens’ social, political and economic options. PRSPs assign substantial and leadership roles to governments from the drafting, submission and implementation stages, and accord them the responsibility to grant and sponsor participation of all members of society. States could commit to actions to integrate representative voices of women in those institutions and processes that set economic and social policies; to provide support to their networks; to integrate plans and proposals from the institutional structures for the advancement of women, and to allocate government expenditures to overcome household biases. Budget audits can be used to review and analyze national budgets and expenditures to determine which groups benefit from fiscal policies, and whether biases against women, poor people or other disadvantaged groups are built into them.

Informal workers, their roles, use of time and restrictions to their freedoms need to be visible. To date, efforts are being made to collect statistical data. Participation of women has transformed the perceived role from one as “secondary worker” to the acknowledgement and consolidation of the position of co-provider, and in many cases the only means of support for the home. The policy issue is how paid employment can accommodate their role in the unpaid domestic and care economy. Support to the reproductive activity can be removed in order for women to focus on learning. These include provision of child-care, proximity to training, scholarships and stipends for transportation. Support to balance work and personal life has been the most cited strength of interventions. No progress is yet observed regarding changes to the division of labour at the household level. Training of women in occupational skills for paid work could be complemented with incentives to employers or to promote men’s taking up care-giving responsibilities.

On the other hand, employers’ organizations, small producers, and civil society groups can advance gender equality if they increase the membership and leadership of women producers and small entrepreneurs in employers’ representative associations; integrate these groups in the formalized procedures of social dialogue; create conditions for small and medium-sized enterprises led by women in service and processing industries; improve capacity and expertise concerning the unique characteristics of small businesses and the role of gender differences; formalize procedures and reporting mechanisms to
include gender equality targets; strengthen the efficiency and productivity of small businesses run by women to make a significant contribution to poverty reduction.

Finally, unions and other organized workers groups could advance the status of women by ensuring balanced membership and substantive leadership of women; showing evidence of their knowledge and commitment to the gender interests of their members; undertaking joint actions with civil society and advocates of gender equality, making visible the concerns of women (i.e. data broken down by sex, emphasis on substantive themes to be negotiated); implementing campaigns to recruit women and to enhance their leadership; negotiating policies to eliminate discrimination on the basis of gender. Conducting bipartite, tripartite or other appropriate forms of negotiation securing proportional participation. In short, protection and promotion of the fundamental rights at work, freedom of association, the right to organize and collective bargaining, equal remuneration, and, tripartite consultation (24) will thus further the creation of enabling conditions to achieve gender equality objectives, i.e. representation, voice and proportional participation in all forms of negotiation processes.

---

24 They are enshrined by key ILO Conventions, namely Convention 87, Convention 98, Convention 100, and Convention 144, respectively.
Bolivia, Grenada, Guyana, Haiti, Honduras and Nicaragua are the PRSP countries in Latin America embarked on a participatory process. In Bolivia, Honduras and Nicaragua, the ILO project, *Gender, Poverty and Employment in Latin America (GPE-AL)* is working with other partners to ensure the integration of the gender dimension in the Poverty Reduction Strategies. In these countries, the project has gone beyond the mere recording of the inequalities between women and men, to preparing an analysis of the processes by which women and men become poorer – related processes yet different – with a focus on the variations in status and the conditions that both experience in the labour market. Women’s work is critical to the survival and security of poor households and is one of the primary routes to escape from poverty and therefore, their contribution should occupy an exceptional place in the formulation and design of policies against poverty. However, in order for women from poor households to be able to take advantage of the newly developed economic opportunities, there must be a dedicated effort to remove obstacles that hamper their positive contribution in the labour market. Diagnosis and ad-hoc studies have thus been carried out to understand the position and constraints that women and men experience in the labour market, complemented with consultations and on-going dialogue with ILO constituents. This information feeds the formulation and design of the strategies to combat poverty.

The participatory process has been followed closely in Bolivia, one of the poorest countries in Latin America. The country allocated the amount of US$ 1,573 million to implement the PRS during a period of 15 years, which was placed in the National Fund for Production and Investment (*Fondo Nacional de Inversión Productiva y Social, FPS*). The objectives set were the expansion of employment and income earning opportunities, capacity building, increasing safety nets and social protection, improving social integration and citizen participation and decentralized systems. The goals set for 2015 are to diminish poverty from the current 63% to 41%; to reduce extreme poverty from the current 37% to 17%, increase life expectancy from 62 to 69 years and to increase schooling rates of people 8 years old or over from 51% to 67%.

The country, immersed in deep-rooted political and economic crises, has seen the ten percent of the poorest lose fifteen percent of their earning capacity, while the ten percent of the wealthiest increased their income by sixteen percent. 83% of the labour force produces 25% of the GDP, while 8.7% of employees from enterprises of more than 50 people produce 65% of the GDP. Social policies have received less budgetary allocations, which represent more tributary pressure over basic consumption goods and income.

In a milieu of social unrest and discontent – which ended in community upheaval in October 2003 – the participatory process, the so-called *Dialogue 2003*, has been discussing and reviewing the Strategy for the Reduction of Poverty (2004-2007) since September 2002.

The following gender equality goals were finally integrated in the XIX version:

---

1. Gender Policies

a) The National Emergency Employment Plan (NEEP) set a target of 30% professional and unemployed women (25 to 50 years old) in public employment. The figure was achieved, and 55% of the beneficiaries are women;
b) The Employment Programme is devoted to professionals and technicians in private enterprises and productive units;
c) The Maternal and Child Health Insurance (MCHI) provides universal, integral and cost-free health-care to women during pregnancy and after-birth and to children up to 5 years of age.

2. Gender gaps and productivity

a) Women’s access to credit and to land. Women will be entitled to property rights, in particular, single mothers;
b) Women’s participation in the use of natural and environmental resources;
c) Equal participation of women in local economic development through micro-enterprises;
d) Provision of food subsidies and milk for school children and employment for women in sectors other than agriculture;
e) Services to women producers through the Bolivian Productivity and Competitive System.

3. Gender and Social Gaps

a) Reach out to women in order to facilitate their access to productive employment, land rights and BONOSOL\(^3\) in the case of older women;
b) Strengthen the Programme of Prevention and Attention to Family and Sexual Violence, and to improve service coordination in the framework of the Law against Family or Domestic Violence;
c) Grant safety, occupational and job facilities to women, and in particular, childcare;
d) Provide nutritional supplements for women;
e) Ensure capacity-building on gender knowledge and expertise;
f) Organize programmes on the responsibility of fatherhood;
g) Ensure legitimate access to decision-making for rural women.

\(^3\) Law 2427/2003, (circa 25 US) for the population over 65 years.