Chapter VIII

CONSIDERATION OF QUESTIONS UNDER THE COUNCIL’S RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE MAINTENANCE OF INTERNATIONAL PEACE AND SECURITY
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Introductory Note** ................................................................. 295

**Part I. Analytical Table of Measures Adopted by the Security Council**

Note ....................................................................................... 297

**Part II**

- The Iranian question (I) .......................................................... 300
- The Greek question — USSR communication dated 21 January 1946 .... 301
- The Indonesian question (I) ....................................................... 302
- The Syrian and Lebanese question .............................................. 302
- The Iranian question (II) ........................................................... 303
- The Spanish question ............................................................... 306
- The Greek question — Ukrainian SSR communication dated 24 August 1946 .... 308
- The Greek frontier incidents question ......................................... 309
- Question of the Statute of the Free Territory of Trieste ..................... 312
- The Corfu Channel question ..................................................... 313
- Appointment of a Governor for the Free Territory of Trieste .................. 314
- The Egyptian question ............................................................. 314
- The Indonesian question (II) ...................................................... 315
- The Palestine question ............................................................ 325
- The India-Pakistan question ...................................................... 344
- The Czechoslovak question ....................................................... 352
- Question of the Free Territory of Trieste ........................................ 353
- The Hyderabad question .......................................................... 355
- Identical notifications dated 29 September 1948 .............................. 354
- Complaint of aggression upon the Republic of Korea ......................... 354
- Complaint of armed invasion of Taiwan (Formosa) ........................... 358
- Complaint of bombing by air forces of the territory of China ............... 359
- The Anglo-Iranian Oil Company case ......................................... 360
INTRODUCTORY NOTE

In chapters I-VI specific aspects of the procedure of the Security Council in the discharge of its functions under Chapters VI and VII of the Charter have been dealt with as general problems in the procedure of the Council. Aspects of practice which arise in the consideration of the substance of questions placed before the Council do not admit of presentation under generalized headings, since the proceedings in each case have necessarily been adapted, within the broad framework of the Charter, to the special circumstances of the case.

Accordingly this chapter indicates the chain of proceedings on the substance of each question included within the Report of the Security Council to the General Assembly under the heading: "Questions Considered by the Security Council under its Responsibility for the Maintenance of International Peace and Security". The range of questions covers broadly those which may be deemed to fall under Chapters VI and VII of the Charter. In chapters X, XI, XII of the Repertoire is presented ancillary material from the Official Records bearing on relevant Articles of the Charter. References to the ancillary material are given at the appropriate points in the entries for each question in this chapter.

I. THE ARRANGEMENT OF CHAPTER VIII

The questions are dealt with in the chronological order of their inclusion in the agenda of the Council. In respect of each question, there is given at the outset a summary of the case presented to the Council as stated in the letter of submission and the initial statement to the Council, together with a summary of the contentions made in rebuttal. The effort has been made to state these issues in the light of their legal and constitutional bearing on the Charter rather than in terms of the political contentions stated before the Council. An indication is also given of the Articles cited in the submission of the question to the Council.

The framework of the material for each question is provided by the succession of affirmative and negative decisions within the purview of this chapter. Decisions related to the subject matter of chapters I-VI of the Repertoire are, with certain exceptions, omitted as not relevant to the purpose of this chapter or of the ancillary chapters X-XII. The decisions are entered in uniform manner. Affirmative decisions are entered under a heading indicative of the content of the decision, and negative decisions are entered under a heading indicative solely of the origin of the proposal or draft resolution. Affirmative decisions have been reproduced in full as constitutive of the practice of the Council, while negative decisions are indicated in summarized form. Where the negative decision relates to a draft resolution in connexion with which discussion has taken place concerning the application of the Charter, the text of the relevant parts of the draft resolution will in most instances be found in chapters X-XII.

The decisions on each question are linked by a brief indication of the proceedings of the Council designed to draw attention to the immediate background of each decision. Where a decision has been preceded by consideration of amendments, these amendments are, for the most part, entered in connexion with the decision; but certain minor textual amendments and certain proposals not voted upon by the Council have been omitted where these are of no import in connexion with the ancillary material relating to the Articles of the Charter which is entered in chapters X-XII.

Chapter VIII, as an outline of the proceedings of the Council in respect of the issues placed before it, constitutes the framework within which the ancillary legal and constitutional discussion recorded in chapters X-XII may be considered. The chapter is an aid to the examination of the deliberations of the Council expressly related to the provisions of the Charter within the context of the chain of proceedings on the agenda item.

For this reason, certain material, notably relating to Articles 1 and 2 of the Charter, will be found entered in this chapter where its significance in relation to the proceedings of the Council can be the more readily appreciated.  

The decisions of the Council entered in respect of each question constitute the pronouncements deriving, directly or indirectly, from the issues submitted in the first instance. The issues before the Council in connexion with a particular question have not infrequently undergone a process of development and transformation in the course of its consideration, with or without change with respect to the Article of the Charter on the basis of which the Council's consideration of the question has been proceeding; and where such development has occurred, the relevant information has been entered. In this manner, the chapter, in conjunction with chapters X-XII, presents the evidence regarding the Articles of the Charter on which the proceedings of the Council have been based in the successive stages in the consideration of the agenda items dealt with in this chapter.

Consideration of the practice of the Council in the discharge of its responsibilities for the maintenance of international peace and security must be based in the first instance on the examination of the issues placed before and considered by the Council and on the texts of the decisions relating thereto. The Council itself has defined in few instances only the relation of these decisions to the individual Articles of the Charter. For this reason, few decisions can be ascribed to specific Articles of the Charter without a certain element of interpretation. In the absence of conclusive evidence in the Records, the attribution of decisions to the Articles of the Charter is a task of interpretation beyond the scope of the Repertoire. Indeed, statements in the Council and the texts of decisions are in many instances indicative of the view that the Council has sought to discharge its responsibility for the maintenance of international peace and security by basing its actions on the general

---

1 For a tabulation of the data on submission, see chapter X, part III.

2 See also chapter XII, Note to part II.
powers conferred upon it by the Charter. In locating the decisions of the Council within the context of the Council’s proceedings on the individual questions before it, the intention has been to make available the texts of decisions in a manner which facilitates the assessment of their constitutional significance.

II. ARRANGEMENT OF CHAPTERS X-XII

In the chapters X, XI and XII of the Repertoire is presented material from the Official Records of the Council bearing on the Articles of the Charter defining the powers and the functions of the Council which are not covered in earlier chapters. The following paragraphs state the criteria of relevance which have governed the assembly of this material.

All proceedings of the Council in the consideration of disputes and situations may be deemed to constitute material for a review of the application of the relevant Articles of the Charter. The statements and counter-statements by parties to a dispute, together with the observations by representatives on the Council regarding the validity or invalidity of such claims, constitute evidence of the range of considerations which the Council has deemed appropriate to entertain in the discharge of its functions. The constitutional significance of these proceedings can, however, be appraised only in the light of the full record.

Nor is it possible within the limitations of the Repertoire of Practice to engage in analysis of the varied measures which the Council has taken in connexion with the questions submitted to it. The adoption or non-adoption of such measures is dependent upon the circumstances of the time, and their efficacy and appropriateness can be appraised only in relation to those circumstances and to developments in the area concerned. In order, however, to afford an empirical guide to the varied measures taken by the Council, there has been included in this chapter an analytical table of measures adopted by the Council arranged broadly according to the type of measure. This table should, however, be regarded as of the nature of an index to chapter VIII; and no constitutional significance should be attached to the headings adopted in the compilation of this table nor to the inclusion of particular measures under the individual headings.

Much of the activity of the Council in connexion with chapters VI and VII of the Charter has taken place through the instrumentality of commissions established to operate in the area of the dispute. These commissions have established their own methods of organization and procedure in accordance with the functions assigned to them. No attempt has been made to reproduce, within the Repertoire of Practice, material relating to the organization and procedures of such commissions save where questions of organization and procedure relating to the commissions have constituted an aspect of the proceedings of the Council itself. Information regarding the organization and procedure of the United Nations Commissions in question will, however, be found in the series of memoranda prepared by the Secretary-General entitled: Organization and Procedure of United Nations Commissions. References to these publications are given at the appropriate points in chapter VIII of the Repertoire.

The material included in chapters X, XI and XII consists of those episodes in the proceedings where the Council has found it necessary to address itself to the relationship of the question before the Council to the terms of the Articles of the Charter. In principle, the material included consists of those instances in which a draft resolution submitted to the Council has raised a problem concerning the application of the Charter, resulting in a connected chain of discussion on the problem of interpretation. The material is arranged under Articles of the Charter, not by reference to the constitutional significance of the eventual decision, but by reference to the problem of interpretation raised by the draft resolution put to the Council. It follows that case histories under each Article of the Charter will include certain incidental material bearing on other Articles of the Charter, wherever, in the consideration of the draft resolution related to one Article, the bearing of other Articles has been adverted to. This method of presenting the material has been adopted as appropriate to the Repertoire of Practice since the significance of particular statements on the application of the Charter can be assessed only in the light of their context.

Though the principle has been adopted that the case histories should commence with draft resolutions expressly related to the Charter, it has not been possible to apply this principle with consistency throughout, either as a method of selection or of arrangement. In certain instances discussion on the bearing of the text of the Charter evoked by a proposal has continued over several meetings of the Council and has ranged over several Articles of the Charter. To maintain the integrity of the chain of proceedings in such instances would afford little assistance in the examination of the material bearing on the individual Articles; and, consequently, in such instances, the effort has been made to present a master history under the Article of the Charter predominantly involved and to include the material bearing on other Articles of the Charter rather in the form of a series of statements. In other instances, protracted debate has taken place on the relationship between the agenda item under consideration by the Council and the text of the Charter. In such instances also the material will be found to consist of a series of related statements, and not of the consideration of a draft resolution, and the reader should refer to chapter VIII in order to assess the significance of this discussion within the context of the proceedings of the Council on the agenda item as a whole. The many instances in which merely incidental reference has been made to the text of the Charter in the statements of representatives on the Council are excluded as not germane to the Repertoire of Practice.

### Part I. Analytical table of measures adopted by the Security Council

#### NOTE

The entries in this tabulation are restricted to a reference to the question, the date of the decision and the serial number of the decision in the S/ series. Reference to subsidiary organs has also been included where appropriate. In most instances paragraph numbers have been indicated to facilitate reference to the texts of resolutions in part II of this chapter. The paragraph numbers have been determined in the following manner:

(i) Where a resolution has numbered paragraphs, they have been used in the tabulation;

(ii) Where paragraphs of a resolution are not numbered, the paragraph noted in the tabulation can be located by counting the paragraphs of the entire resolution, beginning with the first paragraph which follows the introductory words—"The Security Council".

#### I. Preliminary measures for the elucidation of fact

A. Hearing of interested governments and authorities.

   (For invitations extended for the restricted purpose of obtaining information see chapter III, Cases 52, 54, 55, 56, 57. For unrestricted invitations to participate without vote, see the other cases in chapter III, part I, sections C and D.)

B. Appointment of a sub-committee to examine evidence and to conduct an inquiry.

   (i) Spanish question: Decision of 29 April 1946.


C. Establishment of a commission of investigation pursuant to Article 34.

   (i) Greek frontier incidents question: Decision of 19 December 1946 (S/889).

   (ii) India-Pakistan question: Decision of 20 January 1948 (S/654).

#### II. Determination of the nature of the question

A. Determination of the existence of a dispute or situation the continuance of which is likely to endanger the maintenance of international peace and security.

   (i) India-Pakistan question: Decision of 21 April 1948 (S/725), para. 5 of preamble.

B. Determination of the existence of a threat to the peace, breach of the peace, or act of aggression.

   (i) Palestine question: Decision of 15 July 1948 (S/902), para. 2.

   (ii) Complaint of aggression upon the Republic of Korea: Decision of 25 June 1950 (S/1501), para. 2.

#### III. Injunctions to governments and authorities involved in hostilities

A. Precautionary action.

   (i) Palestine question: Decision of 5 March 1948 (S/691), para. 3.

   (ii) India-Pakistan question: President's request of 6 January 1948 (S/636). Decision of 17 January 1948, para. 4 (S/621).

B. Cessation of hostilities.

   (i) Indonesian question (II): Decision of 1 August 1947 (S/459), para. 2.

   (ii) Palestine question: Decision of 1 April 1948 (S/714/1), para. 4.

   (iii) Indonesia-Pakistan question: Decision of 17 April 1948 (S/723), para. 1 (a).


   (v) Indonesia-Pakistan question: Decision of 21 April 1948 (S/726), para. 3 of preamble and part A.

   (vi) Complaint of aggression upon the Republic of Korea: Decision of 25 June 1950 (S/1501), part I.

C. Arrangement, maintenance or prolongation of truce.

   (i) Indonesian question (II): Decision of 29 July 1948 (S/931), para. 2.

   (ii) Palestine question: Decision of 1 April 1948 (S/714/1), para. 3.

   (iii) Palestine question: Decision of 7 July 1948 (S/875), para. 2.


D. Establishment of an armistice.

   (i) Palestine question: Decision of 16 November 1948 (S/1080), paras. 4-5.


#### IV. Measures in connexion with injunctions to be taken by the governments and authorities directly involved in hostilities

A. Withdrawal of fighting personnel.

   (i) Indonesian question (II): Decision of 1 November 1947 (S/597), para. 6.

   (ii) Palestine question: Decision of 4 November 1948 (S/1070), para. 5 (1).

   (iii) Palestine question: Decision of 16 November 1948 (S/1080), para. 5 (6).

B. Demilitarization of an area.

   (i) Palestinian question: Decision of 15 July 1948 (S/902), para. 7.

   (ii) Palestine question: Decision of 4 November 1948 (S/1070), para. 5 (2).


   (iv) Palestine question: Decision of 18 May 1951 (S/2157), paras. 3, 4, 10, 11, 12.

C. Delineation of demarcation lines.

   (i) Palestine question: Decision of 16 November 1948 (S/1080), para. 5 (a).

D. Restriction on the introduction of new fighting personnel into the area of hostilities.

   (i) Palestine question: Decision of 17 April 1948 (S/723), para. 1 (b).

   (ii) Palestine question: Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), para. 3.

   (iii) India-Pakistan question: Decision of 21 April 1948 (S/726), part A, para. 1 (a).
Chapter VIII. Maintenance of international peace and security

E. Restriction on the importation or furnishing of war materials.
   (i) Palestine question:
       Decision of 17 April 1948 (S/723), para. 1 (c).
       Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), para. 5.
   (ii) India-Pakistan question:
       Decision of 21 April 1948 (S/726), part A, para. 1 (a).

F. Restriction on the mobilization of men of military age.
   (i) Palestine question:
       Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), para. 4.

G. Release of political prisoners.
   (i) Indonesia question (II):
       Decision of 24 December 1948 (S/1142, S/1145), para. 3 (b).
       Decision of 28 December 1948 (S/1164), para. 2.
       Decision of 28 January 1949 (S/1234), para. 2.

II. Protection of Holy Places.
   (i) Palestine question:
       Decision of 17 April 1948 (S/723), para. 1 (f).
       Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), para. 6.
       Decision of 15 July 1948 (S/902), para. 7.

J. Freedom of movement and safe conduct of supervision personnel.
   (i) Indonesia question (II):
       Decision of 1 November 1947 (S/597), para. 3.
   (ii) Palestine question:
       Decision of 25 August 1947 (S/525), para. 6.

K. Prevention and punishment of breaches of the truce.
   (i) Palestine question:
       Decision of 1 April 1948 (S/714/1), para. 3.
       Decision of 15 July 1948 (S/903), para. 8.
       Decision of 19 August 1948 (S/983), para. 3 (b) (c) (d).
       Decision of 19 October 1948 (S/1045), para. 6 (c).

L. Termination of the exercise of the right of visit, search and seizure.
   (i) Palestine question:
       Decision of 1 September 1951 (S/2322), paras. 5-10.

V. Measures in connexion with injunctions to be taken by other governments and authorities
A. Prevention of the introduction of fighting personnel.
   (i) Palestine question:
       Decision of 17 April 1948 (S/723), para. 3.
       Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), paras. 3, 13.

B. Prevention of the importation of war materials.
   (i) Palestine question:
       Decision of 17 April 1948 (S/723), para. 3.
       Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), paras. 5, 13.

C. Restriction on assistance by Members to one of the authorities involved.
   (i) Complaint of aggression upon the Republic of Korea:

D. Provision of assistance by Members in circumstances of a breach of the peace.
1. Relief and support of civilian population.
   (i) Complaint of aggression upon the Republic of Korea:
       Decision of 31 July 1950 (S/1657).

2. Provision of assistance to repel an armed attack.
   (i) Complaint of aggression upon the Republic of Korea:
       Decision of 27 June 1950 (S/1511), para. 6.

3. Availability of military forces for a Unified Command.
   (i) Complaint of aggression upon the Republic of Korea:
       Decision of 7 July 1950 (S/1588), para. 3.

4. Designation of the Commander of the Unified Command.
   (i) Complaint of aggression upon the Republic of Korea:
       Decision of 7 July 1950 (S/1588), para. 4.

VI. Measures for settlement
A. Compliance with purposes and principles of the Charter.
   (i) Palestine question:
       Decision of 17 November 1950 (S/1907), para. 10.
       Decision of 8 May 1951 (S/2130), para. 3.
       Decision of 18 May 1951 (S/2157), paras. 11, 15.

(ii) India-Pakistan question:
       President's request of 6 January 1948 (S/636).

B. Procedures of pacific settlement noted, advised or recommended.
1. Direct negotiations.
   (i) Iranian question (I):
       Decision of 30 January 1946, paras. 3, 4.

   (ii) Iranian question (II):
       Decision of 4 April 1946, para. 2.

   (iii) Indonesian question (II):
       Decision of 1 November 1947 (S/597), para. 3.

   (iv) Palestine question:
       Decision of 17 November 1948 (S/1044), para. 1 (c).
       Decision of 4 November 1948 (S/1070), para. 5 (2).
       Decision of 16 November 1948 (S/1080), para. 5.
       Decision of 11 August 1949 (S/1376/II), para. 2.

   (v) India-Pakistan question:
       Decision of 17 January 1949 (S/651),
       Decision of 17 December 1949.

2. Good offices, mediation or conciliation.
   (i) Indonesian question (II):
       Decision of 25 August 1947 (S/525),
       Decision of 28 January 1949 (S/1234), para. 3.

   (ii) Palestine question:
       Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), para. 8.
       Decision of 15 July 1948 (S/902), para. 10.

   (iii) India-Pakistan question:
       Decision of 21 April 1948 (S/726), para. 7.
       Decision of 14 March 1950 (S/1469), para. 2 (6) (c).

3. Arbitration.
   (i) Indonesian question (II):
       Decision of 1 August 1947 (S/459).

   (ii) India-Pakistan question:

   (i) Corfu Channel question:
       Decision of 9 April 1947 (S/324), para. 2.

C. Provisions bearing on issues of substance, including terms of settlement.
1. Determination of accession of territory by plebiscite.
   (i) India-Pakistan question:
       Decision of 21 April 1948 (S/726), part B.

---

1 For establishment of subsidiary organs in connexion with these procedures see infra, VII B2.
Part 1. Analytical table of measures adopted  

299

D. In connexion with the General Assembly.
(i) Spanish question:
Decision of 4 November 1946.
(ii) Greek Frontier Incident question:
Decision of 15 September 1947 (S/555).
(iii) Palestine question:
Decision of 1 April 1948 (S/7714/II).

VII. Measures to promote the implementation of resolutions of the Security Council

A. Notice of possible action under Chapter VII of the Charter.
(i) Palestine question:
Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), para. 12.

Decision of 15 July 1948 (S/902), para. 4.
Decision of 4 November 1948 (S/1070), para. 6.

B. Establishment or employment of subsidiary organs.

1. For observation or supervision in connexion with the ending of hostilities.

(i) Indonesian question (II):
Decision of 25 August 1947 (S/525), para. 5 (Consular Commission at Batavia).
Decision of 24 December 1948 (S/1142, S/1145) (Committee of Good Offices).

(ii) Palestine question:
Decision of 23 April 1948 (S/727) (Truce Commission).
Decision of 12 May 1948 (Truce Commission).
Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), para. 7 (Mediator and Truce Commission).
Decision of 15 July 1948 (S/902), para. 8 (Mediator).
Decision of 16 November 1948 (S/1080), para. 5 (Acting Mediator).
Decision of 11 August 1949 (S/1376/II), para. 7 (Chief of Staff of the Truce Supervision Organization).

(iii) India-Pakistan question:

(iv) Complaint of aggression upon the Republic of Korea:

2. For good offices, mediation or conciliation.

(i) Indonesian question (II):
Decision of 25 August 1947 (S/525/II) (Committee of Good Offices).

(ii) Palestine question:
Decision of 29 May 1948 (S/801), para. 8 (Mediator).
Decision of 15 July 1948 (S/902), para. 10 (Mediator).
Decision of 16 November 1948 (S/1080), para. 5 (Acting Mediator).

(iii) India-Pakistan question:
Decision of 15 March 1949 (S/1376/II), para. 2 (United Nations Representative for India and Pakistan).

3. For the organization of a plebiscite.

(i) India-Pakistan question:
Decision of 21 April 1948 (S/726), part B (Plebiscite Administrator).

C. Intercession by the President.

(i) Palestine question:
Report of the President of 15 April 1948.

(ii) India-Pakistan question:
President's request of 6 January 1948 (S/636).
Decision of 17 January 1948 (S/651).
Chapter VIII. Maintenance of international peace and security

E. Time limits fixed for compliance.

(i) Iranian question (II):
   Decision of 8 May 1946, para. 3.
(ii) Indonesian question (II):
   Decision of 23 January 1948 (S/928), para. 2.
(iii) Palestine question:
   Decision of 21 April 1948 (S/726), para. 6 of preamble.
   Decision of 3 June 1948 (S/819), para. 2.
   Decision of 30 March 1951 (S/2392), para. 4 of preamble.

F. Reaffirmation of previous decisions.

(i) Indonesian question (II):
   Decision of 19 October 1948 (S/904).
(ii) Palestine question:
   Decision of 25 November 1948.
   Decision of 10 November 1951 (S/2392), para. 2 of preamble.

VIII. Measures to ensure further consideration and to ascertain compliance

A. Request for information on the progress of settlement.

1. From the parties.
   (i) Iranian question (I):
      Decision of 30 January 1946, para. 4.
   (ii) Palestinian question:
      Decision of 8 May 1946, para. 3.
   (iii) Indian-Pakistan question:
      Decision of 1 October 1947 (S/521).