UNDT/2013/164, Cobarrubias

UNAT Held or UNDT Pronouncements

The Applicant alleged that his due process rights were breached and that the sanction was not proportional. Upon review, the Tribunal considers that the Respondent correctly established the facts but did not fully take into account the mitigating circumstances. The sanction applied is therefore too harsh and is modified by the Tribunal. The contested decision is rescinded and the Applicant is to be reinstated. The disciplinary sanction of separation from service with compensation in lieu of notice and without termination indemnities applied to him is replaced with the sanctions of a written censure, demotion of one grade from grade G-6 step X to G-5 step X with deferment for three years of his eligibility for consideration for promotion starting from 4 April 2011 until 4 April 2014. Due to the presence of exceptional circumstances, the Tribunal saw it fit to award the Applicant more than two years net base salary in compensation. The Respondent is ordered to pay the Applicant partial compensation—4 April 2011—until the day of his effective reinstatement. In the event that the Respondent decides not to reinstate the Applicant, he is ordered to compensate him in the amount of USD5,000 and two years and eight months' net base salary as a reasonable equivalent payment for the damages produced by the rescinded decision, at the rate in the effect on the date of the Applicant's separation from service on 4 April 2011.

Decision Contested or Judgment/Order Appealed

The Applicant is seeking the rescission of the decision to separate him from service, with compensation in lieu of notice and without termination indemnities, following conduct that was determined not to be in accordance with the provisions of the ST/SGB/2004/15.

Legal Principle(s)

N/A

Outcome
Judgment entered for Applicant in full or in part
Outcome Extra Text

Only specific performance (including rescission with in lieu compensation)

Full judgment
Full judgment
Applicants/Appellants
Cobarrubias
Entity
DM
Case Number(s)
UNDT/NY/2011/031
Tribunal
UNDT
Registry

New York

Date of Judgement

9 Dec 2013

Duty Judge

Judge Greceanu

Language of Judgment

English

Issuance Type

Judgment

Categories/Subcategories

Compensation

Disciplinary matters / misconduct

Dismissal/separation

Investigation

Applicable Law

Secretary-General's bulletins

- ST/SGB/2004/15
- ST/SGB/2008/4
- ST/SGB/2009/7

Staff Regulations

• Regulation 1.2

Staff Rules

- Rule 10
- Rule 9.6
- Rule 9.7

UNDT Statute

• Article 10

Related Judgments and Orders

UNDT/2010/053

UNDT/2011/012

UNDT/2011/018

UNDT/2011/068

UNDT/2011/086

UNDT/2011/145

UNDT/2010/169

UNDT/2010/194

UNDT/2010/204

UNDT/2011/046

UNDT/2011/061

UNDT/2011/115

UNDT/2011/123

UNDT/2012/061

UNDT/2012/138

UNDT/2013/002

UNDT/2013/080

UNDT/2013/081

UNDT/2013/102

2010-UNAT-022

2010-UNAT-067

2010-UNAT-084

2010-UNAT-090

2010-UNAT-092

2011-UNAT-131

2013-UNAT-295

2013-UNAT-336

UNDT/2009/072

UNDT/2010/171