

UNDT/2010/180, Solanki

UNAT Held or UNDT Pronouncements

The Deputy High Commissioner, who has received a delegation from the High Commissioner, is legally competent to carry out the management evaluation of a decision taken by the latter. The legality of a decision must be assessed as at the date when it was taken, and not in light of subsequent circumstances. As regards promotions, considering the discretionary nature of these decisions, the Tribunal's role is only to review the legality of the procedure followed and to examine whether there have been any errors of fact in the assessment of the staff member's career. Under the principle that similar acts require similar rules, the decision that modifies the original provision governing the promotion procedure in UNHCR must be taken through the same procedure followed to adopt the original provision. The High Commissioner was not bound to follow the APPB recommendations. He was able to legally promote staff members who were not recommended by the APPB as far as they were eligible.

Decision Contested or Judgment/Order Appealed

The applicant, a UNHCR staff member, contests the decision of the High Commissioner not to promote him to the P-5 level in the 2008 annual promotion session.

Legal Principle(s)

N/A

Outcome

Dismissed on merits

Full judgment

[Full judgment](#)

Applicants/Appellants

Solanki

Entity

UNHCR

Case Number(s)

UNDT/GVA/2010/067

Tribunal

UNDT

Registry

Geneva

Date of Judgement

13 Oct 2010

Duty Judge

Judge Cousin

Language of Judgment

English

French

Issuance Type

Judgment

Categories/Subcategories

Management Evaluation

Staff selection (non-selection/non-promotion)

Eligibility

Applicable Law

Administrative Instructions

- ST/AI/2007/1

Former Staff Regulations

- Regulation 8.2

Other UN issuances (guidelines, policies etc.)

- UNHCR Appointments, Postings, Promotion Board (APPB) Procedural Guidelines