Brazil is many Brazils, poverty is multidimensional, hence the actions have to be many: evaluations⁠¹.

Natália Sátyro²

In recent years, Brazil has substantially reduced poverty rates and has taken important steps reducing income inequality, two of its greatest wounds. There is no doubt that the increase in social spending to those who need it has impacted the two processes: reduction of poverty and inequality. The Chart below shows, undoubtedly, the relationship between the increase in social assistance spending and the poverty reduction. What is observed with the indicator used in the Chart, Multidimensional Chronic Poverty Rate, will be verified with the choice of any other measure of poverty, whether considering only income or considering its multidimensionality.

Chart 1 – Evolution of Public Resources on Social Assistance and Multidimensional Chronic Poverty Rate (%)

This text aims to present some actions, some programs and social protection policies that helped in this process by presenting some lessons from recent Brazilian experiences. It is important to emphasize when one assumes that poverty is a multidimensional phenomenon, the transfer of income is a necessary but not sufficient condition to combat it.

Family Grant and its impacts

The Bolsa Familia Program (Family Grant Program - FGP) was implemented by the Luís Inácio Lula da Silva government (2003-2010) in 2004 and, is known for its impact on income distribution and poverty reduction (Soares et al, 2007). The participation of this program in the improvement of these two phenomena has been measured by researchers from all over the world. In fact, these two phenomena are its greatest effects. But only a few know that the extent and effects are even greater than that. The combination of a more universalistic perspective of reaching the majority or the entire poor population, with a strategy of starting off for those most in need, with the delivery of the benefit directly to

---

¹ Paper written to the Group Meeting on “Strategies for Eradicating Poverty to Achieve Sustainable Development for All” that the Division for Social Policy and Development of the United Nations Department of
² She is associate professor of Political Science at the Federal University of Minas Gerais (UFMG), in Belo Horizonte, Brazil, and Postdoctoral Fellow at the University of Oxford (2016/2017).
women, accompanied by services of different natures resulted in a significant impact. Mainly, when we consider the low expenditure as a percentage of GDP, showing its low relative cost.

The Continuous Cash Benefit (CCB) occupies a prominent place alongside the FGP also because of its impacts on poverty reduction and income inequality. Income transfer that targets elderly and disabled people in extreme poverty was determined by the Federal Constitution of 1988 and implemented by the Fernando Henrique Cardosó government (1995-2002) in 1996. The value of the transfer is a minimum wage, much greater value than the FGP, is much more effective in the fight against poverty than the FGP, although it is also much more expensive and reaches fewer families. The fact is that for the type of vulnerability proposed cover, a higher value is a prerequisite for the realization of the protection objective. However, much of the literature comparing conditional cash transfer across countries, in general, points to its impact on the Gini Index, along with the FGP.

![Chart 2 – Gini Index – Brazil – 1992 - 2014](image)

Source: Jannuzzi and Souza, 2016:32.

The research results emphasize how the beneficiaries children of the FGP attend school more frequently than the non-beneficiaries, present greater school progression, fewer chances of repetition: generally, chances are 11% less, however, among children from 6 to 15 years which meet 85% of the attendance, there is a 40% less chance of repeating the year (Oliveira and Soares, 2013, Bastagli, 2008, Jannuzzi and Pinto, 2014). Simões points out that the longer the benefit is received, the greater will be the proficiency of the beneficiaries of the 4th grade of elementary school (Simões, 2012). This allows us to infer that income transfer takes away hunger at first, but ending poverty requires more investment on time for human capital formation.

Impacts are also important in the Health area. From the first findings, it has showed the increase of food consumption in all food groups, but mainly meat, milk and dairy products, cereals, beans, sugar (Lignani et al., 2011; Jannuzzi, 2014). Not surprisingly, researchers have showed a decrease in acute malnutrition, but not only, the impact is on the nutritional status of children and adolescents, and its best performance in the North and Northeast reaches 31.4% higher than in the other regions (Baptiestella, 2012; Pinto et al, 2016, FAO, 2015). In addition, more children were vaccinated, pregnant women were receiving prenatal care more often than non-beneficiaries, and their babies were born with a greater weight (3.26kg) compared to the others (3.22kg). As a consequence, there is a
decrease in infant mortality, mainly deaths due to malnutrition and diarrhea, which fell by 65% and 53%, respectively. Research also shows that when the FGP is associated with the services of the Family Health Program, the results are even more significant in relation to the health indicators (Jannuzzi and Pinto, 2014: 185-186).

Researchers also point to a greater participation in the labour market of adult beneficiaries, especially women, concomitant with the decrease in child labour (Oliveira et al, 2007; Tavares, 2008). All the researchers that did look for into this subject, demystified the idea that the benefit induces laziness.

Other programs

However, it is well known that income transfer does not solve all problems since poverty is multidimensional. The transfer of income is a necessary condition, but not sufficient to break the generational cycle of poverty. Vicious cycles of poverty are broken only by combating them on their various dimensions. The FGP has reduced poverty and extreme poverty but there are still many people under these conditions. As a strategy to intensify the fight against poverty and extreme poverty, the Dilma Roussef government (2011-2016) maintained and reinforced the conditional cash transfer (CCTs) and launched the Brasil Sem Miséria (Brazil without Misery) and the Brasil Carinhoso (Affectionate Brazil) programs. Having learned the immediate results of the transfer of income through the FGP and, now, having a greater capacity for diagnosis and localization of the extremely poor, the government recognized the insufficiency of the FGP for families with very young children; the government calculated the necessary complement for each family could get out from poverty, ‘Affectionate Brazil’. The expectations of the results can be visualized in the Chart below.

Chart 3 – Simulation of the reduction of extreme poverty with no BFG, of extreme poverty after BFG, and of extreme poverty with BFG and Brazil without Misery.


‘Brazil without Misery’ was designed with a focus on the multidimensionality of poverty in a clear recognition of limitations of income transference. Thus, the program aims to articulate a variety of actions and programs on a smaller scale than the FGP, in spite of being huge in absolute terms, ranging from food distribution, combating child labour, productive insertion, professional qualification, social assistance services, Health care services, electricity supply and clean water for all, among others.
With regard to food and nutritional security, we can observe parallel actions both within the MDS\(^3\) itself and in the MEC, for example. The distribution of food in different public facilities and actions that aim at water supply, technical assistance to small farmers, among others, are used as parallel strategies to the PTCR in the fight against poverty by the federal government. In this list of actions that stand out from the most recent emphases in the construction of restaurants and community kitchens, as well as the Food Acquisition Program (PAA) to the National School Feeding Program (PNAE), the oldest and largest of them, managed by the MEC.

The PNAE was implemented since 1954 and promotes food security for all students enrolled in public schools in the country, where nutritionists prepare the menus. The menus respect the eating habits of the different regions and localities and the local agricultural vocation. As it is offered to all public school students, it reaches a mostly low-income audience. In 2015, the Program benefited approximately 42.6 million students of basic education and of youth and adults, at a cost of R $ 3.8 billion. Since 2009, the program has earmarked 30% of the budget for the direct purchase of family farming products in order to stimulate the economic development of local communities (Pinto, Melo and Sardinha, 2016).

The PAA, created in 2003, aims at both the food security of the population and the economic development of local communities, building a network between the small family farmer and the government itself. The government buys the products to serve schools, popular restaurants, the basic social assistance protection network, and other equipment that provides public services. Thus, on the one hand, the middlemen were eliminated from the production chain (before it, they took most of the profit) and, on the other hand, it is a way to ensure an outlet for the production of the small farmer. These actions, added to the CCTs, have substantially reduced food insecurity. The Chart below shows the prevalence of malnourishment.

![Chart 4 Prevalence of malnourishment](chart.png)

Source: Pinto et al, 2016:61.

The advances in this area in Brazil have been systematically recorded, analyzed, and the FAO Food Insecurity Status Report considers them as a model in the area of food security in 2015 (Baptistella, 2012; Pinto et al., 2016, FAO, 2015).

---

\(^3\) Ministry of Social Development and Fight Against Hunger (MDS), created in 2004. Under Michel Temer administration the MDS was reshaped to Ministry of Social and Agrarian Development, in 2016.
In a context of poverty such as in Brazil, it is also important to combat child labour, a premise to ensure that children attend school properly. Since 1996, Brazil has implemented the Child Labour Eradication Program (PETI) as a way to combat child labour. Initially, it consisted of a monetary transfer for families with per capita income of up to a minimum wage with children and adolescents from 7 to 14 years of age in work situation of poor families. First, it was directed to the worst forms of child labour (ex. charcoal), but quickly expanded to all forms of child work. From its third year, the program was expanded to the entire national territory. Later, at the time of the FGP, the ideas of school attendance and referral to social assistance services were added. The results are widely recognized. Between 1992 and 2014, the number of children and adolescents in labour between the ages of 5 and 17 was reduced from 8.4 million to 3.3 million. If we remove from this number the adolescents between 14 and 17 who are considered apprentices and those who are employed on the formal market in permitted occupations, the reduction reached 63.5% between 1992 and 2014 (Montagner, 2016). The results also show that there was a 74% reduction between 1992 and 2014 in the numbers of children and adolescents up to 15 years of age in labour, the program's target audience (Montagner, 2016).

Chart 5 – Evolution those who were on labour market (occupied), by age and child labour, Brazil – 1992-2014.

Source: Montagner, 2016:89.

The research reveals important changes in the age profile of child labour when compared before and after the program: in the 90's, 68% of this vulnerable segment was between 5 and 13 years old; in 2010, 80% were between 14 and 17 years old (Montagner, 2016). In other words, one can talk of a generation less exposed to early work. The results show that among adolescents aged 14 and 15 years the coverage is 95%, for those among them that work the coverage is 89% in 2014. Between 16 and 17 years the coverage was 70%, substantially higher rates than in the 1990s. Montagner points out that in this area there are two important research findings: one that there is demand for more technical content in socio-educational activities from adolescents and their families in order to better qualify for work; and second, reducing child labour in such a program does not occur immediately. The author points out that it is only after the family starts to trust in the regularity of the benefit that behavioural change is observed in relation to work and school attendance, especially for boys (Montagner, 2016: 188).
However, there is no fight against poverty without educational policy. Education is the key to the intergenerational breakdown of poverty. Brazil has achieved universal primary education since the end of the 1990s with 98% of children between 7 and 14 years of age at school. Since then, all educational indicators have been improved, but, unfortunately, slower than the need.

However, there are two basic battles still underway: to improve the quality of schools and to keep poor children and adolescents in school. As we have seen, FGP beneficiaries have better attendance school, have better proficiency, and stay in school more when compared to those with the same socioeconomic profile without benefit. But it is very important to understand that one-third of low-income students leave school because of their need of work, and 13.1% of girls due to early pregnancy, which is the multi-dimensionality face of the problems surrounding this population (XXXX).

Chart 6 – Evolution of Illiteracy Rate between children with 10 to 14 years old, by region, Brazil (1981-2014).

In order to improve chances of to get on labour market, the federal government has done two actions of distinctive nature: one focusing on those who does not have sufficient technical qualification because they did not finish their basic education, and the other is to reach those who did complete basic education but could not achieve undergraduate courses. For the first segment, in 2011, the federal government launched the National Program of Access to Technical Education and Employment (Pronatec). It was to expand the offer of professional education in Brazil open to all, but prioritizing its access to public school students, workers, and beneficiaries of the CCTs. In 2014 there were eight million enrolments, with 2,836,925 million enrolments (2,490,119 individuals) in the form of so-called Training Grant (Bolsa Formação). We can see it in the Chart below. In 2014, 63.1% of the registrations were public of the Cadastro Único (Single Registry) and, among these, 33% belonged to the FGP. And the records show that among the 80.3% approved candidates, 87.7% were Pronatec's public linked to BSM (Lucena and Fonseca, 2106: 116).
The results clearly show the positive effects of the program. In the beginning, labour market insertion was higher for the population with the same profile but with a higher income cut (control group), but in the end, the percentage inserted in the formal job market was similar to the two groups (Lucena and Fonseca, 2106). The next Chart shows the different of presence on the labour market before and after the course, to Bolsa Familia beneficiaries and control, and to the CadÚnico registered and the control group.

Chart 8 – Comparison of the percentage of the formal job before and after the training program of those between 18 to 64 years old who finished the training, by FGP and Single Registry origin (treatment groups), with those who were not trained (control group), (Brazil, 2011 to 2014)

Considering the integrality of the educational actions related to the socioassistencial actions, some programs were thought to make that the public reaches universities. Since getting poorer young people to higher education improves their chances of entering the formal labour market with better jobs and salaries. There has been a deliberate policy of the federal government since mid-2000 to increase enrolment in higher education in general. The earliest program is the Higher Education Student Fund (FIES), created by Provisional Measure No. 1,827 in 1999 to replace the Educational Credit (1976). This was created by the
State capacity as a prerequisite

But public policy is not done without state capacity, more specifically in its bureaucratic-administrative dimension at all levels of policy, program and action management. To understand this, we will use the National Policy of Social Assistance case as an example. It is necessary to emphasize the importance of four central factors on the development process of this policy since 2003: 1) the structuring of the MDS, and its qualified bureaucracy; 2) the institutional spaces of federative articulation of social assistance policies, namely the Tripartite Interagency Commission (Comissão Intergestores Tripartite - CIT), the Bipartite Interagency Commission (CIBs – to the state level) and the National Social Welfare Council (Conselho Nacional de Assistência Social - CNAS), as well as the capacity of part of the MDS’s bureaucracy to dialogue within these spaces; 3) the construction of bureaucratic capacity at the municipal level which is the place of implementation of social policy; and, lastly 4) the development and its improvement in time of the Cadastro Único.

The creation of the MDS and the strengthening of its bureaucracy was an essential factor for the development of the national policy of social assistance since it meant an institutional space for policies to combat hunger and poverty. It was also essential to build its bureaucracy with different characteristics, more technical in National Bureau of Citizenship Income (Secretaria Nacional de Renda de Cidadania - SENARC), where the FGP is managed, and the structure responsible for social welfare services and benefits, located at the National Social Welfare Bureau (Secretaria Nacional de Assistência Social - SNAS). The second one has a political profile because they need do agreements with the municipalities in order to have the execution of the services. What has been observed in Brazil in recent times has been an institutional learning within the MDS both to increase and valorize the technicians as well as the mechanisms to create incentives at the municipal level for the implementation of the policy. These mechanisms are part of the federal Government's induction strategies for municipalities, based on the creation of financial incentives for each required action: paid for the quality of the family register, paid for the referral for Pronatec of young beneficiaries or registered in the Single Registry, etc. (Sâtyro and Cunha, 2016).

However, there was also an organizational learning, one that involves various agencies and institutions. In Brazil, municipalities (5,570) and states (26 plus Federal Districts) are politically autonomous federative entities, this means that they are free to adhere to or not to a national policy. The national policies are formulated at the federal level but the provision of services takes place at the local level; therefore, it is necessary to have a prior agreement and the articulation of the different federative entities and of different actors at the local level. These federative agreements were being built based on the articulation of the SNAS technicians in the specific spaces for this: the CIT, the CIBs, and the CNAS.
But joining the municipalities by itself would not yet solve the problem. The social assistance policy is a recent policy and until 2004 the existence of public equipment for this type of service was practically null and there were no professionals hired by the state for this. Therefore, the policy would depend on both the assembly of public equipment and the contracting of a local bureaucracy, basic premises for the provision of social assistance services. Considering that in Brazil there are 5,570 municipalities and that they vary greatly in terms of their bureaucratic and administrative capacity, this was a great challenge. Sátyro and Cunha (2016) show us to the inductive capacity of the MDS in this process and the centrality of the CIT and CNAS. The agreements occurred within the CIT's ambit and they were enacted into law by the CNAS, which published them as resolutions. The 2015 Census reports 8,155 CRAS with 91,965 workers, 2,435 CREAS with 22,288 workers, and 235 POP centers with 3,108 workers. If we take the social workers in the private organizations we reach around 260,000 workers at 2014 (Sátyro and Cunha, 2016).

Investing in this capacity was a prerequisite because it is in the municipality where those policies happen. Each of these factors appears as a necessary condition to achieve these objectives, although alone they would not be enough (Sátyro and Cunha, 2016).

Last but not least, there is the centrality of the Single Registry to Social Programs (Cadastro Único para Programas Sociais - CadÚnico) in this process. The CadÚnico was created in 2001, in the administration of Cardoso, and has detailed data for the family and for each one of its members. This not only allows for the corrected location of the poor and extremely poor population but also enables the bureaucracy to makes more precise diagnoses of poverty dimensions, beyond income. More than that they can geomap the information on the basis of national territory since the data provide identification of individuals and households. It allows the articulation of the FGP to all other programs not only at the federal level but at the state and municipal levels as well (Mostafa and Sátyro, 2014).

Final Considerations and Recommendations:

We know that none of the achieved results of poverty reduction or income inequality are the result of a social program by itself, but a policy of valorization of the minimum wage above inflation, job creation and economic growth in general with its undeniable benefits. However, combining universal social policies with programs able to address the different dimensions of poverty has proven to be an effective and efficient strategy. From Brazil's recent experience some considerations that reflect the learning of the last 15 years may help in future policies.

State capacity in its bureaucratic and administrative dimensions is a prerequisite to overcoming poverty and it is well known that the countries of the Southern Hemisphere present different levels of these capacities. However, bureaucratic-administrative capacity is a necessary condition to diagnose the characteristics of poverty, to map where it occurs, to formulate and implement policies to combat poverty, as well as to identify bottlenecks in processes and programs. Therefore, it is important to improve existing institutional and legal frameworks, create new ones with regard to the legal framework (laws, regulations, resolutions) and institutional frameworks; also, is a prerequisite investment in high and medium-level bureaucracies as well as on street-level bureaucracies. It means that in a federative arrangement like Brazil, it has been necessary to increase the capacity of the different levels of government to act. The decentralization of policies guarantees the increase of its capillarity and ability to act. Reach the adherence of federative entities that are politically autonomous was a challenge by itself. The use of induction strategies with the systematic creation of incentives and the functioning of the agreements were essential in this process.
Only rarely it would be possible to overcome poverty only through actions of the central government. Coordination should, therefore, be central, but there are areas that will require a decentralization of activities and the establishment of partnerships with state and local governments and enterprises not necessarily for the provision of services, but for the provision of technical assistance, for instance. Here two real examples help to understand better: first, for qualification programs and support to the rural farmer, the results depended heavily on the partnership with state rural technical assistance and extension companies (EMATER); second, actions in some complex issues such as the fight against child sexual exploitation need to be articulated between several institutions of protection, which could be the judicial bodies, prosecutors, Federal Highway Police, Civil Police, the Specialized Social Welfare Reference Centers (CREAS), Guardianship Council, among others.

Other important learning point has been that the results depend on the stability of processes and relationships. State and municipal governments, as well as other partners and entities, need of stable sources of resources for the execution and financing of actions.

We also learned from the recent Brazilian experience that direct income transfer is a necessary condition to assure immediate basic needs and its impact on the survival of these people is immediate. But in order to break the cycle of historical poverty, actions to the various dimensions of poverty are needed; it means to serve diverse vulnerable segments in their different vulnerabilities. Starting from the assumption of the multi-dimensionality of poverty, it imposes a specific challenge that is "to deal with segments of marked deficiencies and high specificity, such as quilombola populations, indigenous people, and traditional communities", for example (Karam, 2016:251). But it is also to deal with the different needs of an average family and individual; a family needs help because it has the presence of a disabled dependent on home care, the other because it needs technical qualification for its members, and further because it does not have access to clean water; and fourthly there are children out of school and adolescents working without having finished formal education. This framework does not allow standardized actions on a large scale. And for some dimensions there is no national standardization, - it has to be articulated regionally.

Another thing is about the time benefits of CCT. Those of short duration are important for the immediate overcoming of poverty, but they do not guarantee the intergenerational breakdown of poverty. If a lack of income is solved with immediate transfer action, the ability of a family to generate income is not solved with short and temporary actions unless there is some change in the labour market that guarantees employability independent of human capital. But with regard to the other dimensions of poverty in general, they depend on time to be effectively reversed. The Brazilian experience shows, for example, that overcoming child labour depends on time. Results show that "the beneficiary's confidence that there will be stability in the benefit would not occur immediately but as the family began to rely on the regularity of the benefit, especially for the boys." Each round had smaller weekly working days (Montagner, 2016). What allows us to confirm the idea of transference solves the problem of immediate survival, but behavioural changes and human capital formation demand regularity over time in a long term. It is necessary to ensure that a whole generation has systematic access to health, education and work so that it has real distinct chances compared to their parents.

Finally, it would be possible to highlight other learning points and other programs. However, it is better to highlight the risk of some programs that emphasize a supposed market empowerment such as microcredit programs. These programs have a bias, an addiction, they carry a huge risk of transferring the responsibility of the solution to an individual plan of something that is structural. Poverty need be combated by macro-structural efforts against poverty; individual accountability can not replace the need to address the
problem structurally. Like this, every program that blames the woman for their children wellbeing, or the individual for its trajectory, misses the focus. We need to be careful.

Lastly, however, all these experiences are threatened. If the actual government, of Michel Temer, stay so much longer doing its “reforms”, my next talking will be about the dismantling social policies in Brazil and the increasing of poverty and inequality.

References
SÁTYRO, Natália and CUNHA, Eleonora. The transformative capacity of the Brazilian federal government in building a social welfare bureaucracy in the municipalities. Mimeo. 2016.