



---

### **Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues**

#### **Eleventh session**

New York, 7-18 May 2012

Item 9 of the provisional agenda<sup>1</sup>

#### **Future Work of the Permanent Forum, including issues of the Economic and Social Council and emerging issues**

#### **Study on the Impacts of land use change and climate change on indigenous reindeer herders' livelihoods and land management, including culturally adjusted criteria for indigenous land uses**

#### *Summary*

At its tenth session in May 2011, the Permanent Forum appointed Anna Naykanchina<sup>2</sup>, a member of the Permanent Forum to undertake a study on the impacts of land use change and climate change on indigenous reindeer herders' livelihoods and land management, including culturally adjusted criteria for indigenous land uses and requested the report be submitted to the Permanent Forum's Eleventh session in May, 2012.

---

<sup>1</sup> E/C.19/2012/1

<sup>2</sup> The author wishes to acknowledge invaluable assistance in drafting of this report: Association of World Reindeer Herders, UArctic EALAT Institute, International Centre for Reindeer Husbandry, GridA, Elle Bals, Anna Degteva, Ole Johan Gaup, Alexander Grigorev Inger Marie G. Eira, Kathrine Johnsen, Rebecaa Lawrence, Anne Marie Magga, Svein D. Mathiesen, Helena Omma, Konstantin Oshchepkov, Anders Oskal, Mikhail Pogodaev, Ellen Inga Turi, Johan M Turi, Johan Daniel Turi, Isak Turi, Ivan Tuprin, Igor Slepuskin, Alexander Seretteo, and Matthias Åhren.

# Advance Unedited Version

## Content

<b>I.</b>	<b>Introduction .....</b>
<b>II.</b>	<b>Taiga and Tundra reindeer husbandry .....</b>
<b>III.</b>	<b>Climate Change and Reindeer Husbandry.....</b>
<b>IV.</b>	<b>Land use change and reindeer husbandry .....</b>
<b>V.</b>	<b>Reindeer herding – Case analysis.....</b>
A.	Sampi .....
B.	Yamal Nenets AO .....
C.	Sahka Yakutia .....
D.	Baikal region .....
E.	Sakalin .....
F.	Mongolia .....
<b>VI.</b>	<b>Conclusion.....</b>
<b>VII.</b>	<b>Recommendations.....</b>

# Advance Unedited Version

## I. Introduction

1. Reindeer pastoralism represents models in sustainable exploitation and management of Arctic terrestrial ecosystems that is based on generations of experience accumulated, conserved, developed and adapted to the climatic and political/economic systems of the North. Reindeer have major cultural and economic significance for indigenous peoples of the North. The human-ecological systems in the North, like reindeer pastoralism, are sensitive to change, more than in any other region of the globe, due to the variability of the Arctic climate and the way of life of Arctic indigenous peoples. More than twenty indigenous groups are reindeer herding peoples. Reindeer husbandry is practiced in Norway, Sweden, Finland, Russia, Mongolia, China, Alaska, Canada and Greenland. It involves some 100,000 herders and 2.5 million semi-domesticated reindeer.<sup>3</sup>

2. World reindeer herders, owing to their experience, traditional knowledge and skills, have developed unique management strategies for the protection of pastures, observation of changes and rational use of the natural resources. Reindeer herders should have the right to determine their own future, based on their own philosophy of life and understanding of the world. They should also be consulted, included and accepted as partners when development, research and monitoring takes place on their territories. For many indigenous peoples, reindeer represents their cultural, economic, social and spiritual foundation. The intimate connection between humans and animals is perhaps best embodied by this relationship, as reindeer husbandry represents a connection ancient in origin and practiced almost identically wherever it is found.

3. There have been recent reports on Climate Change and its impacts in the Arctic on and Reindeer Herding by Mr. John B. Henriksen<sup>4</sup> and Mr. Lars-Anders Baer.<sup>5</sup> The Special Rapporteur on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples also reported on the critical conditions related to the loss of grazing land for Sami reindeer herders in Finland, Sweden and Norway (2009). The Permanent Forum has also made recommendations that States must ensure that transnational corporations and other business enterprises on indigenous peoples' traditional lands comply with the specific standards contained in the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples and ILO Convention No. 169 on Indigenous and tribal Peoples

---

<sup>3</sup> Magga *et al.*, 2011, Maynard *et al* 2009, Oskal *et al.*, 2009, Turi, J.M 2002

<sup>4</sup> *The Impacts of Climate Change and Accelerated Threats on Traditional Knowledge, Innovations and Practices: The Specific Vulnerabilities of Indigenous and Local Communities of the Arctic, Small island States and High Altitudes to the Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity* (2007).

<sup>5</sup> *Study on the impact of climate change adaptation and mitigation measures on reindeer herding* (2010)

# Advance Unedited Version

1989. According to Magga *et al.*<sup>6</sup> the future for reindeer herders' communities is dependent on reindeer herders' use of traditional knowledge and integrating scientific knowledge when considering risks as well as the diversity of reindeer herders and their social organizations and economies, and understanding biological diversity and flexible use of pastures.

4. The IPY EALAT Outreach Reindeer Herding and Climate Change in cooperation with the Association of World Reindeer Herders held a side event at the Permanent Forum in May 2011 based on the Arctic Council's report.<sup>7</sup> Recommendations from the side event included 1) An urgent need to implement international laws on the rights of indigenous peoples in domestic and local legal systems, and to ensure not only formal equality but equality in practice of indigenous peoples' rights to lands, territories and resources; 2) A need to undertake a study on the impacts of land-use change and climate change on indigenous reindeer herders' economies and land management; 3) A need to increase reindeer herders' capacity in negotiating with developers competing for their grazing land in public or private industrial development and having access to free legal advice; and 4) A need to increase the transparency in decision-making concerning land use and resource exploration/ exploitation.

## **II. Taiga and Tundra reindeer husbandry**

5. The 1600's marked a transformation of indigenous reindeer economies as competing nation states began a process of colonizing indigenous peoples by encroaching on their lands and utilizing their resources in the Arctic. For some, this represented an opportunity as reindeer herds grew to feed the growing markets. Russian expansion into the vastness of Siberia in search of fur was enabled by reindeer as both food and transportation. Today, there is a difference between tundra and taiga reindeer husbandry. Tundra refers to long migrations in the summer to coastal or mountain areas to flee insects and access better pastures. Winter marks a return inland to shelter, a more stable climate and a change in diet. Herds tend to be large, up to several thousand and migration routes are long, often many hundreds of kilometres. With a focus on meat production, this type is practiced by Sami, Nenets, Komi, Eveny, Chukchi and Koryak. Taiga reindeer husbandry is geographically widespread, and is characterized by smaller herds, by riding the animals, and much shorter migration routes in

---

<sup>6</sup> Ibid.

<sup>7</sup> Ibid

# Advance Unedited Version

forested or mountainous areas. Animals are primarily used for transportation and milk production.<sup>8</sup>

### III. Climate Change and Reindeer Husbandry

6. According to Oskal<sup>9</sup> and Magga<sup>10</sup> climatic and socio-economic change are now evident across the Arctic, and particularly in reindeer herding cultures and in their traditional areas. Global and regional scenarios project dramatic changes in temperature, precipitation and snow conditions in the key areas for reindeer herding and in social-economic changes for reindeer herding communities in the Arctic. Climate scenarios indicate that winter temperatures in Finnmark, Norway and the Yamal Nenets AO, Russia may increase by 7 to 8 °C in 100 years.<sup>11</sup> The largest temperature increase is projected mainly for the inland, but warming is expected for the Yamal peninsula in the Russian north. Future scenarios indicate that Yamal Nents AO winter temperatures in 2070–2100 may be comparable with inland Finnmark winter temperatures during the period 1961–1990. Inland temperatures in Finnmark, Norway may also resemble those of the coastal area of Finnmark (Nordreisa) today.<sup>12</sup>

7. Indigenous traditional knowledge, culture, and language provide a central foundation for adaptation and resilience to the rapid changes in the Arctic. Reindeer herding cultures and traditional knowledge are inevitably affected by institutional governance, economic conditions and other regulatory practices and conditions. Both scientific and traditional experience-based knowledge, knowledge transformation, education and training of future leaders are key factors for the future sustainability of reindeer herders' societies. Engaging reindeer herding youth directly in herding practices and providing enhanced education is a key factor in the future sustainability of reindeer husbandry and its cultural foundations. A vision of a self-sustained and adaptive reindeer community in the circumpolar North is increasingly faced with rapid climate change, regulatory challenges, and altered or degraded pasture lands. Addressing climate change in reindeer herding societies might require novel methodological approaches. Recognizing the ability to adapt to change, as demonstrated by reindeer herding, is based on knowledge embodied in the language, the institutions of

---

<sup>8</sup> Johnsen, K *et al.*, 2012.

<sup>9</sup> Oskal *et al* (2009)

<sup>10</sup> Magga *et al.*, (2011)

<sup>11</sup> Benestad, (2011).

<sup>12</sup> Engen-Skaugen, 2007

# Advance Unedited Version

pastoralism and the knowledge and the actions of individual herders which should also be documented, analyzed and combined with data in the social and natural sciences.<sup>13</sup>

## **IV. Land use change and reindeer husbandry**

8. It is important to recognize that reindeer nomadism is a highly extensive form of land use. Degradation of pasture lands combined with the consequences of a changing climate present substantial challenges to the future of reindeer husbandry.<sup>14</sup> For herders the principle issue is the securing the habitat and landscapes in which to graze their reindeer in different seasons and conditions. Indeed, the progressive and effectively irreversible loss of the uncultivated lands which reindeer use as pasture is probably the single greatest threat to reindeer husbandry in the circumpolar North today. Preservation of rangeland is, likewise, perhaps the single greatest priority for sustaining the resilience of reindeer herding confronted by changes due to climate change, and the socio-economic environment. It is important to recognize the special rights of indigenous reindeer herding peoples to their traditional living areas, and that these rights also include the right to land use, management, protection and natural resources.

9. Mattias Åhrén, President of the Sámi Council, on the occasion of the 6<sup>th</sup> Ministerial Meeting of the Arctic Council in Tromsø 29 April 2009 requested States to consider indigenous territories in its claims to natural resources in the Arctic. Likewise, IPY EALAT pointed out that reindeer herders' ability to adapt to climate change would be jeopardized by industrial development and would impact on indigenous peoples' nature-based livelihoods.<sup>15</sup>

---

## **V. Reindeer herding – Case analysis**

### **A. Sapmi Norway, Finland and Sweden.**

10. The traditional areas of Sami reindeer husbandry were divided between the borders of four nation states: Norway, Sweden, Finland and Russia during the 19th and 20th Centuries. Approximately 6,500 Samis work as reindeer herders in Scandinavia. Reindeer husbandry in the Sami region is characterized by larger herds in Norway and Sweden and a high degree of mechanization. Reindeer are primarily used for their meat production, though hides, bones and antlers are an important source of material for clothing and handicrafts. Recruitment to

---

<sup>13</sup> Magga *et al.*, 2011.

<sup>14</sup> Vistnes *et al.*, 2009.

<sup>15</sup> Magga *et al.*, 2011

# Advance Unedited Version

the industry has been limited in Norway and Sweden by legislation, and a lack of pastures and economic opportunities has limited the expansion of the livelihood.

11. Today the high north strategy of Norway include development of new industrial projects such as mining, offshore oil/gas extraction, green energy and tourism in the regions traditionally used by Sami people. It is important to provide information and insights on how resource conflicts could be avoided by including local Arctic societies and right holders such as reindeer herders at the early planning stages in any industrial development. Facing the new industrial development of the Arctic, there is a real danger that benefits from industrial development will only be awarded to mainstream society, while indigenous peoples will bear the costs. Further, these industrial projects were planned at the same time when it was officially decided to decrease the numbers of reindeer and reindeer herders in Finnmark county of Northern Norway. This decision was based on the need to maintain sustainable reindeer husbandry. Furthermore, Norway has not yet developed climate change adaptation strategy plans for Sami reindeer husbandry, which might result in decreasing the herders' vulnerability to future changes. It therefore raises questions as whether the research and education methods about reindeer herding in Norway, which were applied over the past 30 years, are now adequate to deal with the new challenges in the Arctic.

12. Sami reindeer herders in Norway should be able to meet the global challenges at a time when various national and global actors are able to coordinate their goals and strategies in the herders' pasture areas. Reindeer pastoralism must be empowered to face the effect of global changes in the Arctic. New educational programs that take into account Arctic culture, resilience, sustainable development, climate change and insights into indigenous peoples' societies and languages should be developed. Future training of Arctic leaders might be one way to avoid conflict between herders and developers and respect the reindeer societies' basic need for survival.

13. In Finland, reindeer husbandry is not ethnically restricted to Sami and the livelihood is open to any individual from the European Union. In total there are approximately 5,600 reindeer owners, the vast majority of whom are Finns. The reindeer husbandry area in Finland lies in the most northerly parts of the country and covers almost the entire area of the Province of Lapland and part of the Province of Oulu. The reindeer husbandry area covers 114 000 km<sup>2</sup>, which is 36 per cent of the entire surface area of Finland. The northernmost part

# Advance Unedited Version

of the Finnish reindeer husbandry region is classified as the ‘Sami reindeer herding area’, where Sami reindeer husbandry is concentrated. Reindeer herding is administered through a reindeer cooperative system of which each reindeer owner is a member. The current maximum number of reindeer in Finland has been set at 200,000 with individual ownership restricted from between 3-500 reindeer depending on location.

14. Two contradictory trends can be traced in global resource politics which is also reflected in Sweden. On the one hand, there is a growing global acknowledgement of indigenous territorial and resource rights and recognition of these rights for all indigenous peoples, including the Sami. It also includes the recognition of the continued survival of traditional land-uses, such as reindeer herding. On the other hand, there is a dramatic increase in extractive activities and infrastructure projects on traditional indigenous lands, due to and including rising global commodity prices, energy demands, changing climate policies, and population increases. As the situation currently stands, the last remaining Sami reindeer herding lands are being fragmented, piece by piece, by forestry, wind power parks, mining projects and hydro-power developments.

15. While Sweden is generally highly regarded for its respect for and advocacy of human rights and indigenous peoples’ rights abroad, Sweden has received on-going critique from the United Nations for not acknowledging Sami resource rights at home<sup>16</sup>. Given this governance gap, and the lack of protection of Sami rights by the Swedish state, increasing attention is being paid to the responsibilities that corporations must bear for their activities. This is often mediated through discourses of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR). Implicit in the concept of CSR is the idea that corporations should go *beyond* what is required by national laws. There are few companies in Sweden going beyond the law in terms of recognising Sami rights. In short, CSR practices in Sweden remain undeveloped. Moreover, while there are some (limited) positive examples of companies going beyond the law, these same companies have reported that *other* companies have pressured them *not* to go beyond the law, for fear that it would ‘raise the bar’ for the industry as a whole. Undoubtedly, there is much room for development in Sweden for better CSR practices, yet CSR can never be the single solution to the question of indigenous rights. CSR is a double-edged sword: it encourages companies to

---

<sup>16</sup> See e.g. the UN Special Rapporteur ‘s report regarding the Sámi in Norway, Sweden and Finland, A/HCR/18/35/Add.2, at paras. 46-47. See also N. Bankes, ‘Legal Systems’ in *Arctic Human Development Report*, pp. 112-13.



# Advance Unedited Version

go beyond the law, but this is only ever *voluntary*. Better CSR practices also need to be matched with a stronger national legislation and regulation concerning Sami rights.

16. The fact remains that national legislation and regulation in Sweden is lacking, and many Sami communities, alongside NGOs such as the Sami Council and the National Swedish Sami Association, have sought to make corporations accountable for respecting Sami rights, even if the State will not. First, Swedish corporations operating in Sweden generally perceive CSR issues, including human rights and indigenous rights, to be primarily the concerns of the developing world, such as Africa or South America. Rarely do Swedish companies accept that indigenous rights should be a relevant concern for their *Swedish* operations. What might be described as a Swedish sense of ‘self-righteousness’ (*självgodhet*) blinds Swedish companies to the fact that Sweden does not currently live up to international standards and norms on indigenous rights. A similar ‘blind faith’ can also be witnessed with foreign companies operating in Sweden, particularly in the exploration and mining industry. For example, Australian and Canadian companies commonly place an enormous amount of trust in the Swedish government and Swedish authorities to ‘deal with Sami issues’. Secondly, many Swedish companies, particularly in the mining, forestry and hydro-power industries, have played an active role in the colonization of Sami lands and the dispossession of Sami from their traditional territories. This is not something that is generally recognized or spoken about within these industries. In other words, no acknowledgement is given to the historical and on-going industrial colonization of Swedish Sápmi by resource industries. Thus, companies commonly perceive their activities as justified because they have a state permit. But they fail to recognize that the planning processes by which they have acquired a State permit marginalize Sami interests and do not guarantee the protection of Sami rights. Thirdly, structural discrimination and racial prejudice against Sami people continues to persist in both the private and public sectors in Sweden<sup>17</sup>. This constrains Sami peoples’ opportunities to influence planning processes and resource projects affecting their traditional lands and resource rights.

---

<sup>17</sup> <http://www.do.se/Documents/Material/Gamla%20ombudsm%c3%a4nnens%20material/discrimination-of-the-Sami.pdf>

# Advance Unedited Version

## **B. Yamal, North-West Siberia**

17. The Nenets live mainly in the tundra, forest tundra and Northern taiga belt of the European and Western Siberian from the Kanin Peninsula in the west, to the Gydansk-Peninsula of the Yenisey delta. They form the largest indigenous group of the Russian North and are one of the world's biggest reindeer herding peoples. The bulk of Nenets reindeer husbandry is situated on the Yamal Peninsula which is the world's largest area of reindeer husbandry. Reindeers are used for meat production, clothing, traditional handicraft production and transportation. Reindeer are central to the social, cultural, spiritual and economic life of the Nenets' peoples.

18. Land, including pasture quality and availability is the main concern for the Yamal reindeer herders, who still exercise their traditional nomadic livelihood, migrating with reindeer up to 1000 km a year. The problem of land use change in Yamal might be divided into several dimensions, namely (i) land use change due to industrial development of natural resources; (ii) different legal status of lands used by herders in one-year-cycle of their migration; and (iii) the discrepancies in the rights to land attached to the organizational status of reindeer herders.

19. Industrial development of hydrocarbon resources in the Yamal-Nenets AO has played a key role in Russia's energy wellbeing. The region provides 90% of Russian gas production and there is no alternative to opening the Yamal peninsula reserves to support the current level of gas production. The project development of Yamal hydrocarbon reserves includes the development of railways and pipelines, drilling facilities, housing for new-comers in the industrial areas and other infrastructures connecting Tambey, Bovanenkovo and South groups of oil and gas fields. The peninsula, until recently had no transport and other infrastructure, will now have facilities for drilling, extraction and transportation of oil and gas. For reindeer herders such activities cause direct pasture loss and decrease in pasture quality in the areas around the industrial objects. Although the physical footprint of oil and gas production and transportation infrastructure might take less than 1 % of territory, the industrial development has a strong impact on the system of traditional migration patterns. Some families have to move to new pastures and feel they have lost their homelands.

20. The different legal status of lands used by herders in the annual cycle of their migration complicates obtaining official permission for land use. Traditionally, the winter pastures of many reindeer herders from the Yamal peninsula are located in the forest zone

# Advance Unedited Version

across the Ob bay in the Nadym municipality. According to Russian law, the forests which are the winter pastures are under federal jurisdiction and can be licensed out for the maximum period of 5 years. While the tundra zone which is the spring, summer and autumn pastures is under the regional jurisdictions, it is YNAO authorities who manage the land use and have the right to license these territories out for the maximum period of 25 years. These disproportions in rental time and application of different legal regimes make it difficult for reindeer herders to establish the full and official permissions to use the land which is needed in one-year-cycle of nomadic migration.

21. The discrepancies in the rights to land attached to the organizational status of reindeer herders are the biggest potential threats for traditional reindeer herding land use. Currently reindeer husbandry is organized in three structures: 1) large reindeer herding enterprises (the former Soviet state agricultural organization), which are the official pasture land users; 2) private herders, who are organized as legal entities called communities or *obshchiny* which informs the State about the pastures they are using; 3) private herders (so-called individual households), who are not a part of any legal entity. Currently, private herders do not have a legal right to use the pasture lands for their traditional livelihood, since pastures in Yamal municipality are officially rented by large reindeer herder enterprises. In YNAO there is a political understanding of the customary right to land as there is no legal prohibition or restrictions for any reindeer herder to use the pastures. The immediate legal implication for private herders is their lack of involvement in and lack of information about industrial activities on their traditional pastures. In Yamal, the private herders are more vulnerable to both the loss of grazing land to the rapid industrial development, and the change in political will towards controlling and restricting reindeer husbandry, such as pasture use and the number of reindeer.

## **C. Sakha Republic (Yakutia)**

22. The Republic of Sakha (Yakutia) is the largest region of the Russian Federation with territory covering 1/5 of the Russian Federation. With such a vast size, reindeer herding is as diverse as the region itself. The Republic of Sakha (Yakutia) includes high Arctic, sub-arctic, mountain-taiga and taiga ecosystems. Five distinct indigenous peoples herd reindeer in Sakha: Evens, Evenki, Dolgan, Yukagirs and Chukchi. Twenty five per cent of the entire Republic is considered as reindeer pastures though it has been estimated that there are more lands in the Republic which could potentially be used as grazing lands for reindeer, signifying

# Advance Unedited Version

its potential for growth<sup>18</sup>. The vast majority of reindeer pastures and potential pastures are in the forestry zone of the Republic.<sup>19</sup> This is important as according to Russian legislation, the forestry lands are under Federal management, while lands that are designated as agricultural are under the management of local authorities.

23. Currently there are over 200,000 reindeer herded by over 2,200 people who work and migrate with reindeer on a full-time basis. Reindeer are primarily owned by various state and public bodies although nearly 10% are held privately.<sup>20</sup> There are a wide variety of subsidies that are provided to herders by the regions in areas that include increased livestock, transportation and education.

24. In the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia) 80,437.2 thousand hectares of land or 25.8% of the total area of the republic are accounted by Land Cadastre authorities as reindeer pastures. However, the same authorities recently recognized that there are more lands in the Republic which potentially could be used as grazing lands for reindeer,<sup>21</sup> while the category “reindeer herding land” does not exist as such in the official land classification, but there are “forestry fund land” and “land of agricultural designation”.

25. In Yakutia the most significant areas of reindeer pastures are located in the forests and include 75% of pasture lands, 15% of agricultural lands and 9% are protected areas.<sup>22</sup> According to Russian legislation, the forestry lands are under the federal management, while lands of agricultural designation are under the local authorities’ management.

26. The neighboring district of Olenek is now becoming important in the development of the diamond industry. The Prime Minister of the Russian Federation has recently signed the decree on license rights to the new deposit of diamond *Verkhne-Munskoe* in the middle of Olenek region.<sup>23</sup> For both Anabar and Olenek districts the problem of wild reindeer grazing and their migration routes is most challenging. During 1990s, many domestic reindeers were lost and lured away by wild reindeers belonging to the Bulun, Leno-Olenek and Taimyr populations. This also represented a loss of reindeer herding pastures due to climate change as well as changes in the wild deer populations, which had been controlled during the Soviet times. The routes of wild reindeer migrations have also changed and become unpredictable.

---

<sup>18</sup> National Report, 2009

<sup>19</sup> Ibid

<sup>20</sup> Ministry of Agriculture of the Republic of Sakha (Yakutia), 2010

<sup>21</sup> National Report, 2009

<sup>22</sup> State National Report, 2009

<sup>23</sup> RIA-Novosti Information Agency

# Advance Unedited Version

At an EALAT workshop in Anabar and Olenek, participants drew attention to an urgent need to develop monitoring systems on migrations of wild reindeer and traditional knowledge.

27. An EALAT workshop was also held in the settlement of Topolinoe in Tompo region, the Eastern economic district of Yakutia where there are plans for industrial development. It is related to the implementation of the so-called Tompo mining district investment project designated in the Scheme 2020. This project includes extraction of natural resources of gold, wolfram, copper and steam coal. The effects on indigenous peoples in the area and their traditional land use were completely ignored in the project. No assessment of potential environmental damage and the withdrawal of reindeer pastures were made, nor any compensation for the possible losses considered.

28. Among the three projected industrial areas, the most intensive industrial development is already happening in the Southern economic district of Yakutia. This region is a home to more than four thousand Evenki, Even and other indigenous reindeer herders involved in a very special type of taiga reindeer husbandry as well as more than sixty nomadic *obshinas* and few States, collective and municipal reindeer herding enterprises. In this area reindeer pastures, hunting and fishing grounds are used by reindeer herding units and communities of Aldan, Olekma and Neryungri *ulus*.

## *The Project of Integrated Development of Southern Yakutia*

29. The plans for regional development will cause a reduction in reindeer pastures as well as their fragmentation and degradation. The participants of workshops held in Southern Yakutia were concerned with industrial development of their territories, in particular with the reduction of reindeer pastures, environmental degradation and lack of dialogue between herders and industrial companies. The herders reported that their interests were not taken into consideration when making decisions regarding the development of the area. For example, the reindeer herding community of Idzhek has repeatedly appealed to RusHydro company to take the herders' interests into account when designing and constructing the Cancun hydro power plant. The winter pastures of the community are in the area of proposed hydroelectric dam and it is expected they will be flooded by the dam. However, no formal response was received from neither the company or from representatives of the government.<sup>24</sup>

---

<sup>24</sup> Results from the EALAT workshop in Khatystyr, 2009

# Advance Unedited Version

30. Due to industrial development moving into the reindeer pastures, there are challenges for reindeer herders, such as disturbance for animals, loss of pastures, degradation of land, loss of biodiversity and poaching of reindeer which limits their coping and adaptation strategies. Climate change and globalization are also important drivers which affect reindeer herding. At the same time, economic development of the region brings some prospects and opportunities for reindeer herders like development of reindeer meat markets, access to transportation and communication infrastructure and social services. The challenge is to balance impacts and prospects that development brings to reindeer herders.

## **D. Baikal Region**

31. The Baikal Region covers the territory of the drainage basin of Baikal and includes three subjects of the Russian Federation (Republic of Buryatia, Zabaykalsky Krai, and Irkutsk Oblast). The term “the Baikal Region” is relatively recent. Previously, the standard terms used in regional economics were “Pribaikalye” (an area adjacent to Baikal of the Irkutsk Oblast) and “Zabaikalye” (a part of the Republic of Buryatia and Zabaykalsky Krai). The total area size of the Baikal Region is 315 thousand square km. From ancient times this area was home to indigenous peoples practicing the taiga type of northern reindeer herding (the Evenki, the Tofalars, and the Soyots).

32. Due to government national policy, the Soyots (the Okinsky District of the Republic of Buryatia) completely lost the practice of reindeer herding. In 1963 reindeer herding in Okinsky District was declared unproductive and eradicated, which led to an irrevocable loss of valuable gene pool of the domestic animal. Towards the end of 1980s the community, with the support of the district administration decided to restore reindeer herding. Reindeer were bought in the Nizhneudinsk Region of the Irkutsk Oblast, however, during the intervening years the Soyots had lost all knowledge of reindeer herding. As of January 1, 2011 only CJSC “Erbyek” is engaged in reindeer herding and maintains 22 reindeers.

33. The government has been inattentive to reindeer herding as a sector of traditional economic activity, and the organizational issues such as economic and livestock-veterinarian problems were poorly solved. Thus, in the Soviet years the reindeer were kept by the kolkhoz (collective farms) and solkhoz (state-farms) there was a loss of interest in reindeer herding due to the decrease in cargo transportation and geological expeditions for industrial needs

# Advance Unedited Version

were no longer hired. Reindeer herding became subject to the effects of the Soviet crisis period which led to a very difficult situation. The fall in the northern domestic reindeer population ensued as result of a decrease in government support of northern kolkhoz and sovkhos, low subsistence level, weak adaptability by the indigenous peoples of the North to the quickly changing market circumstances of the economy, and the low level of commodity production in reindeer herding and marketability.

34. At the beginning of 2004 there was a small rise in the domestic reindeer population of the Baikal Region. This was largely promoted by the State as an approach to the problems of reindeer herding adopted by State powers, and also because of measures taken in the sphere of agriculture and agriculture product market regulation. In order to provide government support to northern reindeer herding from the budget funds certain measures were taken such as adjusting accountability of reindeer economies and organizing subsidies.

35. In spite of the measures taken in resolving the issues of reindeer herding some problems of taiga reindeer herding in the region still remain. Over the years no improvements were made in the breeding and productive qualities of the reindeer. Secondly, the indigenous peoples' communities have no fixed territories and reindeer grazing fields. All reindeer grazing fields are located within forested areas that are in federal possession, and the area unit usage rent is very high. Thirdly, reindeer herding as a sector of the agricultural economy does not exist in the agricultural register of the Irkutsk Oblast. Fourthly, there is a lack of regional laws and economic programs that support and help develop reindeer herding. Fifthly, reindeer herding is greatly damaged by predators (wolves). Sixthly, there is industrial development of the traditional territories of the indigenous peoples such as mining, gas and oil industry, building of Baikal/Amur Railway and road, and deforestation. The threat to the future of the taiga reindeer herding in the Baikal Region is evident. Further, the territories of the traditional habitat of the indigenous peoples, and the places of their traditional way of life, may be subject to the development of new minefields and developing industrial companies. The reindeer grazing fields and the camping areas of the reindeer herders will be negatively affected by the industry. The Strategy for social-economic development of the Far East and the Baikal Region №2094-р, for the period December 28, 2009 to 2025 adopted by the government of the Russian Federation, is aimed at quickening the growth (on the innovative basis) of the economic potential of this part of the country in order to realize the interest of Russia in the Asia-Pacific Region, which assumes a complete use of natural resources.



# Advance Unedited Version

## **E. Sakhalin**

36. Reindeer herding in Sakhalin has twice been subjected to forced and acute changes from the government however, the most drastic change is happening on the current stage. According to research, reindeer herding came to Sakhalin at the end of the sixteenth and beginning of the seventeenth century along with reindeer herders, the Evenki, that migrated from the mainland. The reindeer population was at its highest in 1960s and 1970s, the peak period in the development of the collective economy of the Ul'ta and the Evenki. Until 1985 the herd of the domestic reindeer consisted of 15 to 18 thousand heads, however, that number had greatly decreased, eight to tenfold, by 1990s. The process of significant decrease in the population of domestic northern reindeer began in 1990s. In 1991 four thousand head were counted in total in all categories of the economies (collective and private) of the region, and 1,788 head in 1999. In the last ten years only one enterprise has engaged in domestic reindeer herding in the Sakhalin Oblast, and that is the national cooperation called "Valleta." According to the data of the president of the developmental corporation, there are now 164 reindeer in his management. The industrial oil and gas production which became widespread in the end of 1950s in the Nogliksk District has in part affected the regress of the Ul'ta reindeer herding. In 1970s and 1980s, some areas of land were used for developing oilfields and pipelines, as well as building railway lines without any consent or compensation to the communities. All grazing field areas in the village of Nogliki to the settlement of Val were taken away from the reindeer herders and this territory was equipped with oilfields belonging to the company "Sakhalinmorneftegaz." Currently the reindeer herding situation remains very problematic. The development of oil and gas on the Sea of Okhots shelf by foreign and domestic companies as well as activities of coal mining, building of land terminals and pipelines have affected reindeer herding. There is poaching, feralization of the domestic reindeer, increasing number of predators (wolves), massive deforestation, decrease in the number of reindeer moss, high rent for northern reindeer herding at 5.35 rubles per hectare on forest area units, and many other reasons have also led to the catastrophic situation of reindeer herding in Sakhalin.

## **F. Mongolia**

37. Domesticated reindeer herding in Mongolia takes place along the borders of the Russian autonomous republics of Tuva and Buryatia, on the south slopes of the Sayan Mountains. The Dukha system of reindeer husbandry is unique in that it operates on the edge



# Advance Unedited Version

of the transition between taiga and the steppe biomes, on the edge of a reindeer's natural habitat. The herders are Dukha people, the smallest ethnic minority in Mongolia. Their herding traditions are believed to be ancient. Some scientist believes that it was in the Sayan Mountains that the domestication and herding of reindeer first started several thousand years ago. The Dukha population presently includes about 200 nomadic reindeer herders and some 300 people that have adopted a more settled lifestyle in the sum centre. Dukha reindeer husbandry is characterised by small-sized herds and highly nomadic management, though the current herds are below a sustainable level. About forty families herd a total of approximately 1500 reindeer. Nowadays, herding families typically own between 20 to 150 reindeer, although some own as few as five, while a sustainable number would be 50-70 reindeer per family.

38. Traditionally, the Mongolian taiga reindeer herders had small reindeer herds, and the animals were primarily used for transportation and milk production and occasionally slaughtered for consumption. Now, hunting is an important part of the Dukha herders' livelihood. Meat from wild game is the primary source of meat and protein to the Dukha, and the fur and skins were exchanged for other goods. A field study conducted in June 2011 provided information on the current challenges for securing Mongolian reindeer husbandry for the future. Many of the challenges were related to the precarious socio-economic situation of reindeer herders within a market economy. Since the 1990s, government subsidies for salaries and other services have disappeared after 70 years of a Communist regime, and the need for cash income to buy essential services has increased in this formerly subsistence community. The market economy, combined with increasing compensation for the land, has impacted the reindeer herders' land use. Further, the Dukha people have no community members in elected positions at any level of government. They have limited access to legal council and information about civil and human rights, and have no formal ownership or possession of the taiga, all these factors make them vulnerable to exclusion and exploitation.

39. In 2011, the UNHCR reported that the Dukha people face widespread societal and institutional discrimination and human right violations within Mongolian society. The UNESCO Red Book on Endangered Languages lists the *Mongolian Reindeer Tuvan* language as seriously threatened. Reindeer herders interviewed argued that only teaching the children the Tuvan language would secure the indigenous knowledge of the reindeer herding culture

# Advance Unedited Version

and secure the recruitment of a next generation of herders.<sup>25</sup> In addition to being the home of the Dukha reindeer herders, the Mongolian taiga is also a global significant region. As the taiga is also rich in natural resources and a highly rated tourism destination, the herders and the biodiversity are increasingly affected by gold miners, forest loggers and taiga tourists. This situation requires urgent national and international attention and action for strengthening the traditional livelihood of reindeer herders, restoring ecosystems and protection of a number of endangered species. The Dukha reindeer herders have shown resilience over many years by adapting to changing governance regimes such as the establishment of national borders cutting through migration routes, collectivization of reindeer herds, and the transition to market economy. Their herd size has fluctuated but the herders have until now always been able to increase the number of reindeer after a crisis. However, there are limits to the herders' adaptation capacity. There is an urgent need to secure reindeer husbandry as a resilient and sustainable livelihood and further, that the Dukha reindeer herders are able to maintain their cultural identity and rely on nature for their livelihood and well-being, and control their own destiny.

## VI. Conclusion

40. Rapid industrial development combined with social, economic and climate change and variability are creating major challenges for indigenous reindeer herder communities in the Arctic. Indigenous adaptation is strengthened by active practice of traditional knowledge accumulated through generations of reindeer herders. Indigenous peoples' interest and their knowledge should be considered at the early stages of industrial development. There is also an urgent need to implement international laws on the rights of indigenous peoples and ensure their rights to lands, territories and resources. This includes recognizing herders' use and management of grazing land by identifying cultural practices for indigenous land use. There is a need to increase the transparency in decision-making concerning land use and resource exploration/ exploitation in the Arctic and access to of free legal advice regarding development issues. There is increased marginalization of herders when they do not benefit from industrial development, or when cultural values are not recognized and local codes of conduct are ignored. There is also a need for new mechanisms replacing impact assessments related to extraction of energy resources in the Arctic so that small Arctic societies are

---

<sup>25</sup> See e.g. the UN Special Rapporteur 's report regarding the Sámi in Norway, Sweden and Finland, A/HCR/18/35/Add.2, at paras. 46-47. See also N. Bankes, 'Legal Systems' in *Arctic Human Development Report*, pp. 112-13.

# Advance Unedited Version

respected and included in any development process. Reindeer herders rights have to be considered in view of any Arctic governance opportunities and international cooperation that facilitates stronger corporate social responsibility (CSR) by the companies involved. Reindeer herders' sustainable small business must be included in the discussions during the process of development in the Arctic.

## **VII. Recommendations:**

41. It is recommended that States of the Arctic support private reindeer herding as a key foundation for development and maintenance of sustainable reindeer husbandry

42. It is recommended the Arctic Council establish a "Reindeer herders' watch", which would be a tool for monitoring changes in reindeer pastures, that includes a yearly report on changes in reindeer herding

43. That Arctic states recognize nomadic reindeer herding as a unique and incomparable indigenous livelihood and that nomadic indigenous livelihood and economy requires special attention and protection in the future due to rapid changes in the Arctic.

44. Arctic states and private industry need to support the establishment of new institutional mechanisms based on reindeer herders' knowledge, rights and world views that secures reindeer herders' ability to negotiate with industrial developers on an equal manner. Further, that legal advice information about the effects of industrial development be provided and that there is development of new juridical tools to support these institution mechanism to avoid future conflicts.

45. Arctic States and industrial developers must recognize the integrity and holistic view of the use of reindeer pastures which is based on herders' traditional knowledge.

46. Fishing is an important part of the economy of indigenous reindeer people living a traditional nomadic life, and therefore, industrial development should be restricted in the waterways.

# Advance Unedited Version

47. The Russian Federation should integrate special amendments into the federal legislation of the *Forest and Land Codes* to provide the land for traditional economies, including reindeer husbandry.

48. It is recommended the Government of the Russian Federation, the State Duma and the Council of the Federation make it easier and practicably possible to register traditional grazing lands, based on the principle that reindeer herders can use pastures free of charge.

49. It is recommended that GEF be urged to fully endorse UNEP's project titled "*Enhancing The Resilience Of Pastoral Ecosystems And Livelihoods Of Nomadic Herders* (Nomadic Herders Project) coordinated by International Centre Reindeer Centre and GridA.

50. That Arctic States fully implement the Arctic Council project Eallin, "*Reindeer herders Youth*" led by Association of World Reindeer Herders and Russia.

51. That Arctic Industrial developers respect the results from public hearings related to industrial development in reindeer herders pasture land and the results be mandatory for those authorities' who consider commercial development on the territories where traditional nature use occurs.

52. That Arctic states and industrial developers be urged to improve the standards used in impact assessments and agreements with reindeer herders so that they take into account the structure, knowledge of nomadic societies and the cultural base for pasture use and to include herders in the process as early as possible to avoid conflicts.

53. That Finland accepts the legal status of, and provide special protection to Sámi reindeer husbandry in Finland.

54. That the Arctic Council be urged to investigate if the loss of grazing land does affect reindeer herders' indigenous cultures.

55. That Arctic States take necessary steps to identify the lands which reindeer herding peoples' traditionally occupy, and to guarantee effective protection of their rights of

# Advance Unedited Version

ownership and possession and to continually monitor land use changes on such areas.

56. That the Arctic Council:

- Initiate a project to identify reindeer pastures, monitor land use changes and report annually on land use change as well as secure the status of reindeer pastures, taking into account the customary rights of indigenous peoples;
- Implement tools that monitor migration of wild reindeer and regulate their numbers; and
- Create an education system in the traditional economic activities of indigenous peoples, as well as develop conservation projects that document traditional knowledge, language and culture.

57. That there be secure education opportunities for reindeer herding youth, both in terms of locally-based education programs and in terms of funding options. As the system of education of reindeer herders cannot exist outside of a nomadic way of life, it is very important to develop educational institutions and adaptive models of education that are suited to the specific needs of reindeer herders and their families in particular, such as Nomadic Schools and distance learning systems.

58. Urge relevant United Nations agencies to support the Arctic Lavvu Dialogue between industrial developers in the Arctic and circumpolar reindeer herders.

## References

ACIA (2004). *Impacts of a Warming Arctic: Arctic Climate Impact Assessment*. Cambridge University Press 2004. [www.acia.uaf.edu/](http://www.acia.uaf.edu/)

Tyler et. al. (2007). N.J.C. Tyler et. al. *Saami reindeer pastoralism under climate change: Applying a generalized framework for vulnerability studies to a sub-arctic social–ecological system*. *Global Environmental Change*, Volume 17, Issue 2, May 2007, Pages 191-206. [www.elsevier.com/locate/gloenvcha/](http://www.elsevier.com/locate/gloenvcha/)

UNEP (2001). C. Nellemann et. al. GLOBIO. Global Methodology for Mapping

Oskal, A, J.M. Turi, S.D. Mathiesen and P. Burgess (2009): *EALÁT Reindeer Herders' Voice: Reindeer Herding, Traditional Knowledge and Adaptation to Climate Change and Changed Use of the Arctic*. Arctic Council SDWG EALÁT-Information Ministerial Report, International Centre for Reindeer Husbandry and Association of World Reindeer Herders. International Centre for Reindeer Husbandry Report 2:2009

Vistnes I, P. Burgess, S.D. Mathiesen, C. Nellemann, A. Oskal and J.M. Turi (2009): *Reindeer Husbandry and Barents 2030. Impacts of Future Petroleum Development on Reindeer Husbandry in the Barents Region*. Report for StatoilHydro Barents 2030 Scenario Programme. International Centre for Reindeer Husbandry Report 1:2009.

Oskal, A. (2008): *Old Livelihoods in New Weather: Arctic Indigenous Reindeer Herders face the Challenges of Climate Change* Special Report on Climate Change: Low Carbon Economies and Resilient Societies, World Bank Development Outreach Special Issue, World Bank Institute 2008.

Arctic Council Conservation of Flora and Fauna Working Group – CAFF (2006): *World Reindeer Husbandry: Circumpolar Biodiversity Monitoring Programme CBMP EALÁT-Monitoring. Expert Network Monitoring Plan*. Supporting publication to the CAFF Circumpolar Biodiversity Monitoring Program – Framework Document. By Association of World Reindeer Herders and International Centre for Reindeer Husbandry in cooperation with CAFF. CAFF CBMP Report No. 10, CAFF International Secretariat, Akureyri, Iceland, 2006.

Eira, I.M.G., O.H. Magga, M. Bongo, M.N. Sara, S.D. Mathiesen and A. Oskal (2008): *The challenges of Arctic reindeer herding: The interface between reindeer herders' traditional knowledge and modern understanding of the ecology, economy, sociology and management*

# Advance Unedited Version

*of Sámi reindeer herding.* The 12th Biennial Conference of the International Association for the Study of Commons (IASC), 14-18 July 2008, Cheltenham, England.

Nuttall, M., Forest., P.A. and Mathiesen, S.D (2008): *Joint Seminar of the UArctic Rectors' Forum and the Standing Committee of Parliamentarians of the Arctic Region* Background Paper on Climate Change in the Arctic, February 28, 2008 Rovaniemi, Finland.

Oskal, A, J.M. Turi, S.D. Mathiesen and P. Burgess (2009): *EALÁT Reindeer Herders' Voice: Reindeer Herding, Traditional Knowledge and Adaptation to Climate Change and Changed Use of the Arctic.* Arctic Council SDWG EALÁT-Information Ministerial Report, International Centre for Reindeer Husbandry and Association of World Reindeer Herders. International Centre for Reindeer Husbandry Report 2:2009.

Vistnes I, P. Burgess, S.D. Mathiesen, C. Nellemann, A. Oskal and J.M. Turi (2009): *Reindeer Husbandry and Barents 2030. Impacts of Future Petroleum Development on Reindeer Husbandry in the Barents Region.* Report for StatoilHydro Barents 2030 Scenario Programme. International Centre for Reindeer Husbandry Report 1:2009.

Jernsletten, J-L. L. and Klovov, K. 2002. *Sustainable reindeer husbandry.* Arctic Council 2000-2002. University of Tromsø, p.157.

John B. Henriksen 2007 *Highly vulnerable indigenous and local communities, inter alia, of the Arctic, Small Island States and high altitudes, concerning the impacts of climate change and accelerated threats, such as pollution, drought and desertification, to traditional knowledge and practices with a focus of causes and solution*

McCarthy, J.J., Martello, M.L., Corell, R.W., Eckley, N., Fox, S., Hovelsrud-Broda, G.K., Mathiesen, S.D., Polsky, C., Selin, H., Tyler, N.J.C., Strøm Bull, K., Siegel Causey, D., Eira, I.G., Eira, N.I., Eriksen, S., Hanssen-Bauer, I., Kalstad, J.K., Nellemann, C., Oskal, N., Reinert, E., Storeheier, P.V. and Turi, J.M 2005. *Climate Change in Context of Multiple Stressor and Resilience.* Ch 17 Arctic Climate Impact Assessment (ACIA) Cambridge University press. P 945 – 988.

Nellemann, C., Vistnes, I., Jordhøy, P., Strand, O., and Newton, A. (2003) *Progressive impact of piecemeal infrastructure development on wild reindeer.* Biological Conservation 113: 307-317.

Tyler, N.J.C., Turin, J.M., M.A. Sunset, K. Strøm Bull, M.N. Sara, E. Reinert, N. Oskal, C. Nellemann, J.J. McCarthy, Mathiesen, S.D., M.L. Martello, O.H. Magga., G.K. Hovelsrud, I. Hanssen-Bauer, N.I. Eira., I.M.G.Eira and R.W Corell. *Saami reindeer pastoralism under climate change: applying a generalised framework for vulnerability studies to a sub-Arctic social-ecological system.* 2006. Global Environmental Change. Inpress.

# Advance Unedited Version

UNEP (2004) *Arctic environment: European perspectives – why should Europe care*. UNEP and European Environment Agency, Environmental issue report No. 38, EEA, Copenhagen, p. 58.

Vistnes, I. and Nellemann, C. (2001) *Avoidance of cabins, roads, and power lines by reindeer during calving*. Journal of Wildlife Management 65, 915-925.

Vistnes, I., Nellemann, C., Jordhøy, P. and Strand, O. (2004). *Barriers to wild reindeer migration*. Journal of Wildlife Management 68: 101-108

Jernsletten, J.-L. and K. Klovov, *Sustainable reindeer husbandry*, 2002, Senter for samiskstudier, Universitetet i Tromsø: Tromsø.

Inamura, T., *The Transformation of the Community of Tsaatan Reindeer Herders in Mongolia and Their Relationships with the Outside World*, in *Pastoralists and Their Neighbors in Asia and Africa*, K. Ikeya and E. Fratkin, Editors. 2005. p. 123-152.

Donahoe, B., *The Troubled Taiga: Survival on the Move for the Last Nomadic Reindeer Herders of South Siberia, Mongolia, and China*. Cultural Survival Quarterly, 2003. **27**(1): p. 12-22.

Nentwig, I., *Reminiscences About the Reindeer Herders of China*. Cultural Survival Quarterly, 2003. **27**(1).

Vitebsky, P., *The Reindeer People: Living with Animals and Spirits in Siberia*, 2005, Houghton Mifflin.

Totem Peoples. *Brief History of the Reindeer Peoples*. undated [cited 2011 6th October]; Available from: <http://totempeople.hypermart.net/campaign.htm>.

Minority Rights Group International. *Minority Rights Group International, State of the World's Minorities and Indigenous Peoples 2011 - Mongolia*. 6th July 2011 [cited 2011 14th October]; Available from <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4e16d36711.html>.

Keay, M.G. *Tsaatan Community Development: A report of findings from a community-based participatory rural appraisal (PRA) conference*. 2008. TsagaanNuur soum, Hovsgol aimag, Mongolia, January 25-26, 2008: Itgel.

UNESCO. *UNESCO Red Book on Endangered Languages: Northeast Asia*. 1999 24 November 2011]; Available from: [http://www.helsinki.fi/~tasalmin/nasia\\_report.html](http://www.helsinki.fi/~tasalmin/nasia_report.html) - Tuvan.



# Advance Unedited Version