



**United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs in cooperation with the
Ministry of Labor and Social Development of the KR**

**Workshop on the National Policy and Legislation of Kyrgyzstan on Old People
Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan**

September 15-17, 2008

SHORT SUMMARY OF THE WORKSHOP

The report is compiled by HelpAge International Bishkek

Table of Contents

1. Introduction.....	3
1. About the project.....	3-4
2. Short summary of the workshop.....	4-15
3. Conclusions and recommendations.....	16-17
Annexes:	
1. Workshop program	
2. List of the participants	
3. Final document of the workshop	

Introduction

The workshop was the second activity within the UNDESA project “*Capacity building to integrate older persons in development goals and frameworks through the implementation of the Madrid International Plan of Action on Ageing*”, following the interregional conference in Bangkok. Participants included MIPAA national focal point from the Ministry of Labour and Social Development of the Kyrgyz Republic, the leader of the key local NGO working with older people and representatives of HelpAge International.

The objectives of the workshop were:

1. To discuss the priorities of state policy with regard to older people in the light of MIPAA
2. To develop recommendations to the government on implementing MIPAA in the Kyrgyz Republic

The methodology included plenary sessions, presentations and group discussions.

This summary contains the key points of the workshop and can be used by any interested stakeholders, including the Ministry of Labour and Social Development, other government agencies and local NGOs. The participants of the workshop will also get this document for their further use.

The workshop program, list of participants and the final document adopted by the participants at the end of the workshop can be found in the annexes to this document.

About the project

The project’s title is “*Capacity building to integrate older persons in development goals and frameworks through implementation of the Madrid International Plan of Action on Ageing*”. UNDESA is the executing agency of the project and the funding comes from the Development Account. This global project is being implemented in several locations including West Africa (Senegal, Cameroon), **Central Asia (Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan)**, Caribbean (Trinidad and one other country).

The project objective is to strengthen the capacity of Governments to integrate ageing issues into national development policy formulation and programme planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.

Expected accomplishments

- a. Enhanced capacity of stakeholders to integrate ageing issues in national development frameworks;
- b. Improved ability of stakeholders to share experiences, knowledge and lessons learned through a web-based network;
- c. Toolkit developed to replicate methodologies and training materials in other countries.

The Madrid Plan of Action on Ageing, adopted in 2002, calls on the international development community to assist developing countries and countries in transition in its implementation. This project will enhance the capacity of stakeholders in the sub-regions of West Africa, Central Asia, and the Caribbean to integrate ageing issues in national development frameworks through advocacy and competency-based training and training-of-trainers (TOTs) approach. Web-based

networks in each sub-region will enhance knowledge and skills sharing. A tool kit and training materials will be produced to enable other Member States to benefit from the project, its experiences and lessons learned. Immediate targets and beneficiaries are Member States, including policy advisers and programme practitioners, development partners and older persons and their communities.

Summary of the workshop proceedings

DAY 1: The first part of the day was given to official speeches and presentations in plenary session. For details please see the programme of the workshop in Annex 1. The presentations included information about the situation of older people in the Kyrgyz Republic from different sectors, including government, parliament, civil society and UNDESA. They also included information about the efforts being undertaken by each sector respectively.

Key points of the morning plenary sessions:

Government side:

- Ageing of the population represents one of the most complicated and multifaceted issues of the country. A passport to success in achievement of tasks described in the UN Millennium Declaration is resolution of the ageing issue. Wishes of older people themselves should be taken into consideration.
- Ageing in Kyrgyzstan is not such an acute problem as in some other countries, but Kyrgyzstan has become one of the first Central Asian countries to begin implementation of the Madrid Plan of Action.
- Population of our country may be characterized as rather balanced by age group; today the population of Kyrgyzstan is 5.2 m people, and 8% of them are older people.
- At the beginning of 2004 a mission for the needs assessment of older people was held in Kyrgyzstan with UN help, and recommendations were given on the implementation of MIPAA
- To secure all rights, freedoms and interests of older people Kyrgyzstan is participating in the UNDESA project for activation of interrelation between the Parliament, ministries, agencies and non-government organizations in the work with older people.
- Much work is to be carried out, particularly in resolution of the issue of the legal framework with regard to older people.
- Pensions should be 40% of the average salary established in the country; currently they represent 20-26%.

UNDESA:

- Ageing issues relate not only to the economic sphere only, but to social, cultural, psychological and all other aspects of society's life. Ageing of the population, as a whole, can be compared with globalisation, it touches all aspects of life not only at the national level, but at the international level as well.
- Older people's interests should be included in national plans and development programmes. We need to think about ageing not only during our talks about pension reforms, but when we plan the economic development, finances and even road construction in the country.
- It would be more reasonable to discuss the opportunities for societies, particularly young societies such as Kyrgyzstan, which still has a so-called "open window" of opportunities, as demographers say, rather than discussing the problems.

- The state policy and programs should be aimed at meeting the needs of older people. Programs of social security, health and pensions should be implemented with consideration of changing structure and public needs.
- Older people have needs and wants, but they also have interests. Many older people wish and have the opportunity to continue making contributions to the development of society. Therefore, it is important to think of how conditions can be created in society so that older people have the opportunity to participate in life, keep a chance to work as productively as young people, based on their experience and additional training in their profession.
- When we talk about older people, particularly in Asia, we understand it is impossible to resolve issues related to the care of older people without family help. That means it is necessary to think about family support programs.
- Older people in urban areas live and age differently compared to people in rural areas, in remote mountain regions, where the young generation is emigrating. Older people are often discriminated against at work; in some countries they are not hired, sometimes they are exposed to direct humiliation and violence, they are deprived of pensions, apartments. They are humiliated in residential homes for elderly people.
- National programs should apply local tools to give an answer to the following question: how to raise funds to resolve issues of older people in Kyrgyzstan? Older people are the carriers of the cultural heritage, language, history of their own country, and it would be inexcusable to lose this heritage. Interrupting the succession of generations leads to exhaustion of the national cultural, as well as social and economic capacity.
- The image of older people is extremely negative and unfavorable. We should talk about the real image, because if a positive but realistic image of older people is not formed in society, no program will work, since the whole of society will not be interested in their older members.
- We should begin with needs assessment and formation of goals. The demographic situation should be considered, including life of older people, number of young people, economic situation, what this region can afford, social status of people in families and community, programs available, policies, whether they work or not, and if not why not. The goal, priorities and main tasks should be formed based on this analysis.
- We should focus on creation of the national capacity for action on ageing. We should identify what is available at the government level, NGO level, who is dealing with ageing issues and what is being done in this area, what are the human resources, what is the situation with health professionals, how many geriatric doctors there are in Kyrgyzstan, if there is a sufficient number of social workers in the field, if they do their job properly. Certainly it is necessary to mobilize financial resources. Scientific data are needed, and the situation should be assessed based on the statistics office data, national data on births and deaths, as well as old people's opinions.
- Measures to strengthen international cooperation on ageing issues: 4 principle directions are recommended, but not approved yet: (1) Increased social awareness about ageing issues; (2) Comprehensive approach to ageing issues; (3) Enhancing the rights and opportunities for older people and (4) Measures to strengthen national capacity.
- A policy on ageing should be formed. Now there is an opportunity to read the documents under preparation carefully in order to help the Ministry to form successful programs, promote them in the Parliament and make them workable.

Minister of Labour and Social Protection Abdullaeva's points:

- In December 2003 the Madrid Plan of Action was ratified in Kyrgyzstan, and several strategic steps were taken: survey, strategy and programs were developed. The most important aspects are:

- Social services should be developed at the local level with the help and support of ayil okmotu (village authorities). More attention should be paid to this important area.
- Support the activities of Older People's Groups.
- Organization of an effective comprehensive system of social rehabilitation of older people.
- Assess the situation in older people's employment, use their capacity, involve them in the decision-making processes.
- Improve/optimize the pension system as a whole. We are already working on it, but it would be useful to have older people as participants in the process.
- Improve the quality of medical services. Older people have limited access and minimum standards are to be developed based on categories.
- There are six homes for older people in the country, which ought to be for lonely older people only. But today there are older people who have children and relatives, yet are put in these homes.
- Strengthen collaboration among government, IOs and NGOs. Need to optimize it.
- The average pension is still low. Ideally, it should represent 40% of minimum salary levels.

Mrs. Damira Niyazalieva, Member of Parliament:

- At present, there are no institutions to train gerontologist and geriatricians. This factor is affecting the level of medical assistance to older people.
- Importance of developing a gerontology plan, which will be a program document containing the main directions of state policy regarding older people.
- The national strategic documents do not include anything on gerontology, which is a great shortcoming. We are a socially oriented state and the priority groups are older people, children, women and youth.
- Government should promote the implementation of MIPAA in the first place, but NGOs have also a significant role in supporting the government's efforts to implement, monitor and evaluate MIPAA.
- To improve the social conditions of older people, it is necessary to adopt a state program to strengthen social protection of older people and the law about older citizens.
- In the light of the recent price increases, local authorities should pay maximum attention to resolving older peoples' social and household problems.
- Provision with coal, flour and other food items.

Mrs. Gulnara Derbisheva, Member of Parliament:

- Older peoples' problems are the priority of our parliamentary committee on social policy, migration and health. All laws related to social issues should have intensive parliamentary hearings and round table discussions so that the voices of the vulnerable are heard. Much information raising through public hearings should be done with the Concept and the law "About Older Citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic" to take into account the full spectrum of opinions and recommendations.
- Every law adopted by the parliament requires funding. If the law "About Older Citizens of the KR" is adopted in 2009, it will require more than one billion soms for its implementation. It is not easy for our budget, but our committee will work to find the required amount from the budget.

Mrs. Svetlana Bashtovenko, Director of NGO "Resource Center for Elderly":

- Participation of the representatives from different parts of our country is a very important factor.

- By 2025, as was mentioned during some of the presentations today, CIS countries will face a serious demographic problem, the population is ageing. Incomplete economic, social and political reforms and the low level of life of pensioners make the situation “very close to explosion”. Moreover, the financial support to pensioners is a great problem.
- The specific problems of the older generation in Central Asia today include: health related issues, reduced abilities/opportunities for self-service, pre-pension unemployment, not stable material situation, loss of gained social status, difficult situation of older women, vulnerability of migrants, lonely older people and older couples. There is no law to support older people. We have been working on the concept, a working group was created.
- Older people’s issues are not included in the national strategy of the country adopted in 2007. The pension system is not responsive to the needs of older people, unemployment, extreme poverty, isolation, lack of access to legal services, poor nutrition.
- Age Net Central Asia is one of the results of our activities. It is working successfully with 35 members from civil society, state and international organizations from such countries as Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Georgia, Russia and Great Britain.
- Working very closely with HelpAge International since 2002. Our key results within our project: international conference on strengthening the collaboration among government, civil society, older people and international organizations. Adoption of the Course of Action to implement MIPAA in the Kyrgyz Republic. Participation of older people in the whole process. Bishkek resolution about the cooperation mechanisms of different actors.
- The institute of self-help of older people is being developed. It is viewed as a model of comprehensive approach to resolving older people’s social, economic and cultural problems, by older people themselves. There are 6 organizations working with SHGs of older people in our country.
- Other key activities we are undertaking are: campaigns/actions to support older people in partnership with government and civil society organizations, auctions by young volunteers, activities around the International Day of Older People, media coverage, celebrations all over the country. National exhibitions of items produced by older people’s groups. Charity shop.
- There are two “houses of generations” in our country (in Osh and Semenovka village, Issyk-Kul). They are both successful practices where lonely older people and orphan/street children live together.
- Day Center for older people has been opened in Balykchy. The Center does not receive any external funding, but we are trying to keep it going with the support of volunteers.
- Involvement of local youth in new initiatives to support older people’s groups. These young people sponsor two OPGs in Balykchy.

The second part of the day was given to small group discussions under the topic of “ **Priorities of state policy with regard to older people in Kyrgyzstan**”. The discussion was based around the three priority directions of MIPAA: (1) Participation of older people in development; (2) Advancing health and well-being in older age and (3) Creating favorable living conditions for older people. Three groups worked on the first priority on this day.

Key points of the group presentations:

MIPAA priority 1: Participation of older people in development

In Kyrgyzstan older people may be referred to the poorest population group, since pensioners receive low pensions, which are not enough for them.

Ways of resolving this problem:

It is necessary to adopt the “Older Generation” concept and Law *On Older People*.

A department on ageing should be formed under one of the relevant government structures.

It is necessary to improve the pension system, transfer the main part of pension into the national budget (currently, all pensions are coming from the Social Fund’s budget, which is formed on the basis of the national budget)

It is necessary to revise the lists of beneficiaries whose income does not exceed the minimum subsistence level.

It is necessary to make amendments to the laws *On Social State Order* and the Tax Code, having provided benefits to those organizations that help older people, not to introduce the real estate tax for pensioners.

Organize branches to provide older people with access to all areas of educational services.

Problems of older people:

Loneliness

Financial problems, low pension, high prices for utilities

Fraud, which older people are vulnerable to

Discrimination on the basis of age in employment

Legal problems/legal literacy/awareness

Low living standards

No access to common housing services

Health, no money for treatment

Bad roads, lack of water

Back-breaking labor in advanced age (in fields)

Ways of resolution:

Construction of social houses

Raising pensions, bringing pension at least to the minimum subsistence level, transition from the categorical provision of benefits to the targeted principle

Creation of communication clubs and centers for older people

Creation of stores in which food products and consumer goods will be available at low prices; it would be good to add drugstores and organize vacancy fairs for older people

To exempt older people from the real estate tax

DAY 2: The groups continued discussing the second priority of MIPAA “Advancing health and wellbeing in old age”. A very concrete question was formulated by the moderators to facilitate the discussion in the groups.

Question: How are the health and social security systems prepared to provide services to older people?

Problems and constraints:

- Absence of fixed prices in drug stores that does not allow older people to buy medicines at low prices.
- There are no gerontology clinics points and geriatric specialists in the country.

- Insufficient special medical equipment in the health system.
- Lack of middle level specialists, doctors in rural areas that leads to delayed identification of diseases of older people and disease prevention
- Low salary of paramedic personnel that leads to staff turnover, particularly in rural and remote mountainous regions.
- There is no prophylaxis of physical disability of older people.
- There are no special medical programs on mental health. Older citizens facing certain health changes are not provided with necessary aid.
- There is no system for medical social services in in-patient and out-patient establishments for older people in the country.
- Poor social services to older people
- Low salaries for experienced social workers that provide direct assistance to older citizens, leading to permanent staff turnover
- Lack of common system of social services
- There is no access to the state financial resources for older people
- Urgent reform of the system of benefits and guarantees is required
- Development and introduction of social standards in provision of services
- Absence of database with specification of the existing problems of older people in the area of health and social security
- Development of necessary programs, ideological education of young people with regard to older people
- Health is not accessible for older people
- Poor awareness of older people of health programs
- Discrimination by age and financial status
- Sale of fake medicines
- Poor infrastructure of health establishments and absence of minimum facilities for older people.

Ways of resolution:

- Training of gerontological and geriatric specialists at the state level. Creation of the home care systems
- Increase of financing
- Creation of labor conditions
- Transport, other infrastructure
- Raising the prestige and value of social worker profession
- Benefits for people engaged in social services
- State support of NGOs and Public Organizations engaged in providing services to older people
- Monitoring of use of state budget funds with focus on support of older people. Creation of a public council with participation of experts for this purpose.
- Teaching of children, beginning from kindergartens, to respect older people
- Amendments to the Criminal Code for the intended violations of older people's rights to property

Priority direction 3 of MIPAA: Topic: Creation of favorable conditions

Problems:

- Poor and deteriorating conditions in residential homes for older people
- High fees for utilities
- Absence of municipal transport, of benefits in public transport for older people, and conveniences in public transport for older people

- Absence of state aid when purchasing tickets for public transport, including rail and air transport.

Ways of resolution:

- Social house project for older people (new types of residential and day centers)
- Cancellation of fees for older people in public municipal transport
- Purchase of hot and cold water and gas meters at preferential terms
- Creation of a service for the repair of houses for older people
- Monitoring and control by older people their use of public transport.

Topic: Care of older people

Problems:

Infringement of older people's rights

Lack of relevant information for older people in rural and remote areas

Partial absence of the targeted aid

Bureaucratic attitude in public structures

Abandoned older people with children staying at home without any care

Family conflicts and violence against older people

Non-recognition of labor merits by other people

Ways of resolution:

Monitoring of state services, public bodies and other organizations with regard to execution of legislation for support of older people

Public awareness of available social benefits through mass media

Targeting of services

Setting quota for working pensioners

Access to micro-crediting

State support of NGOs working with older people

Ideological work among young people on their attitude to older people

Encouragement of older people participating in public life expressed in upbringing of the growing generation

Topic: Image of the older person in Kyrgyzstan

In Kyrgyzstan image of the older person is positive. It is bedded in the mentality. This deals with respect and honor to the older generation. In the market economy there is one problem related to migration of the young generation. It has a negative impact on the moral climate in families.

DAY 3: The topic of the day was *“Development of tools of implementation of the main directions of state social policy in relation to citizens of older generation”*. Plenary discussion was followed by Questions and Answers. New initiatives such as the concept *“Older Generation”* and the law *‘About Older Citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic’* were presented and discussions took place in the groups.

Key points of the plenary session:

- The concept “Older Generation” is a document that declares the goals and objectives and priorities of the policy with regard to older people in the Kyrgyz Republic, and determines position of the state to one of the basic strategies of the country’s development. Views contained in this concept promote implementation of the state’s priorities related to poverty reduction and sustainable social development aimed at improvement of quality of life for older citizens in the country. This concept will become a directing tool in development of strategic programs in the social area. The concept represents a systematized complex of the political and legal framework and valuable guides, principles and priorities determining the state policy on older people. The policy will focus on the social and demographic group of people, and its content related to meeting needs of older people, interrelation of this age group with other age groups, and representatives of main social security entities. The concept was developed with the purpose to improve conditions for older people through development of various forms of establishments and social development of their activity, establishment of minimum standards for quality of life of older people, economic, health, and various areas and coordination of work of social institutions.
- The concept has established the direction of state policy in conditions of transition from the universal system of social services to the targeted system based on the opportunity and needs of older people in the social service market. Implementation of the concept will create preconditions for the internal capacity and support of dignity of older people in Kyrgyzstan, and implies the creation of a system of effective functioning and interaction of social institutions serving older people, the upgrading of social security, pension and medical aid establishments and complex approach in providing services to older people.
- Implementation of the concept will make it possible to: draw public attention to ageing problems, set priorities of social policy considering the real needs of older people in special support of the state, ensure a system and comprehensive approach to issues of older people, improve effectiveness of social systems of older people, introduce new forms of support to older people.
- The purpose of state policy with regard to the older generation is to give them opportunity to live in safe and dignified conditions, and continue participation in public life as free people. The state policy on older citizens is based on the following principles: state responsibility for consistent activity in creation of permanent services and improvement of the position of older people following changes in society. The state guarantees that all applicable measures on the older generation will not worsen their status.
- The concept considers the critical position of older people in Kyrgyzstan and, based on the recommendations of the Madrid International Plan of Action on Ageing, establishes three main priorities: extension of participation of older people, improvement of quality of health services and social support for older people, and ensuring security in old age.
- Creation of a common mechanism to achieve the goals and objectives of the concept, including the organizational and administrative activity, would imply the following:
 - Undertaking activities on the financial, material and technical support of target programs, projects, plans with details of content of the concept by its functional aspects.
 - Distribution of the organizational and executive functions among participants engaged in implementation of the concept.
 - Establishing state control, execution of laws and sub-legal acts, instructions, target programs, agreement, joint decisions and mutual obligations of donation.

Mass media coverage of objectives and progress of implementation of planned activities, including performance reports of responsible persons to authorities and public.

- Continuous monitoring and analysis of the situation on older citizens of Kyrgyzstan.
 - Support and encouragement by the state, municipal entities and certain persons participating in implementation of the state policy on attitudes to and support for older people.
 - On the basis of the concept, development of government programs to implement the state policy on the older generation.
-
- The Ministry of Labor and Social Development of the KR is responsible for implementation of the concept. The economic mechanism of implementation of the concept includes active involvement of funds of domestic businesses, foreign investments and international grants, and funds of the national and local budgets. Monitoring and evaluation of the year of the concept implementation will be carried out by the Ministry of Labor and Social Development, interested agencies and public organizations.
 - The main parameters of social policy with regard to older people will be:
 - Increase of income
 - Increase of life span
 - Enhancement of participation in development of society
 - Improvement of quality of healthcare and social aid
 - Political formation of traditional attention to older people
 - Change of views on the role of older people in modern society
 - Strengthening positive social tendencies in the society
 - Addressing the issues of interrelations between generations on the basis of principles of fairness and mutual aid
 - Strengthening of guarantees of rights of older persons to development and worthy life
 - An effective system of social protection and social insurance
 - Access of older people to basic social services will improve
 - In the existing legislation of the Kyrgyz Republic there are 10 laws and several resolutions that provide protection for older citizens. There is no law adopted yet that declares benefits for older people regardless of their social status. There is a need to develop a draft law determining the state policy on older people, in order to provide them with equal rights and opportunities to exercises and freedom. The draft law has 9 chapters and 41 articles. It is based on provisions of the *Older Generation* concept considering the three priorities of the Madrid International Plan of Action on Ageing. The draft was developed in accordance with the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic and general international agreements signed by the Kyrgyz Republic.
 - This draft law is included in the law making plan of the Government for 2009. Till the end of the year all sorts of discussions and public hearings will be held in order to develop the draft and ensure that it is really helpful. In 2009 the Government will submit it to the Parliament for consideration. If a decision in Parliament is made in the first half of the year it will be included in the budget for 2010. Recently, the Parliament has adopted a law with the active involvement of representatives of NGOs in discussions and parliamentary hearings. Beginning the following year there plans to identify sufficient funds to implement the requirements of this law.

Suggestions to improve the content of the concept “Older Generation” (some are suggestions to include new additions and some are to improve the paragraphs to make them very concrete and clear)

- Introduce award (medal or certificate of merit) to distinguish pensioners having contributed to development of Kyrgyzstan. President could award it on October 1.
- Create a database of older people willing to work.
- Raise awareness of older people of the existing problems, laws, by-laws and initiatives of older people.
- Improvement of legal mechanisms. The quota should be provided by the government of the Kyrgyz Republic for employ older people.
- Exemption from or partial reduction of tax for enterprises that provide jobs to older people.
- Hold vacancy fairs where older people could come and make themselves known.
- Annual gradual clinical examination of older people having reached the age of seventy.
- Development of immunization of older people. Totally free of charge immunization should be provided to older people.
- Medical insurance and other financial support measures.
- Provide preferential taxation for community based organizations of older people.
- Educate rich people to share with poor people; this may be achieved by the Law On Charity and Patronage, which should be revised.
- Creation of a common database on older people using different approaches.
- Encouragement of initiatives in the area of self-employment of older people and their communities. Encouragement of financial institutions, including mechanisms of credit, in areas where older people are provided with access to resources for development of self-employment. Providing privileged micro credit for development of self employment among older people.
- Development of infrastructure, ensuring social services for older generation citizens. Certainly this also refers to construction of a social house for older people, day care board-houses, and opening of crisis centers for older people having suffered from violence.
- Development of new and adjustment of existing norms, methods and recommendations for construction and reconstruction of residential space of buildings and premises in the main typical aspects, such as medicine, education, household activity and recreation.
- Development of field support services for older people, including support services in their place of residence, including the patronage and geriatric service. To add creation and development of support services.

DAY 4: Two plenary sessions were given

(1) Discussion of the draft law “**About Older Citizens of the KR**”

(2) Implementing new initiatives on ageing in the Kyrgyz Republic: building national capacity.

Group discussions were on the topic of “Capacity to implement new initiatives (concept and the Law) on ageing in the Kyrgyz Republic”. Analysis. Measures to strengthen national capacity on

ageing in the country.

- National infrastructure: who are the major stakeholders (government, NGOs, academia, private sector)? How to coordinate national action on ageing?
- What resources are needed to implement the Concept and the draft Law. Does KR have resources to implement the Concept and the draft Law? What measures are needed to improve the situation?
- Practical measures to implement the Concept and the draft Law

Topic: What does Kyrgyzstan have to do to address ageing related problems?

Concept development is one of the easiest parts of the whole process, while implementation is the most complicated one. Institutional measures are an important aspect. Various types of educational, training and research activities on ageing shall be carried out in the country. Collecting and analyzing the national data is an important aspect in creating a database and forms the information base. Independent monitoring is also an integral part of the plan implementation process. It is important to strengthen cooperation between the major actors - the Government and NGOs.

Such links and cooperation proved to be positive in Kyrgyzstan; however, these need to be further developed. And, of course, it should also include private sector as well as conditions and policies existing in Kyrgyzstan for private sector involvement and participation in public policy. It is necessary to strengthen the links with the academic and scientific-research community. The prioritization process plays an important role when discussing and approving the action plan. It is necessary to decide which activities are the highest priorities for the implementation in the short-term perspective, and which are of a lesser priority either due to the existing resources, or in terms of the importance of the specific area. Besides, it is also necessary to have strengthened human resources, that is training of specialists is also important. In the context of Kyrgyzstan, gerontological problems can be identified. It should be considered which skills are required in order to be better equipped and to be dominant in terms of planning tools, so as to ensure better implementation of the policy.

A National Coordinating Council or Committee including relevant ministries should be created. Much will depend on who would issue the Decree or Resolution on establishing the Committee and who would chair it. The Coordinating Committee should have clear authorities, mandate and terms of reference. It is important to ensure proper organization of meetings of this Committee so that it had issues for consideration on its agendas, and relevant minutes of these meetings to enable people to track issues discussed by the Committee as well as the outcomes of the meetings.

There is a need in seminars for raising awareness and informing government representatives on the strategy as a whole and on the progress with implementing action plans and other aspects as part of the information campaign.

The responsibility for fulfilling obligations under the Madrid Plan at the expense of the budget is with the state: the Ministry of Labor and Social Development, Ministry of Health, Social Fund, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Education, Ministry of Fuel and Energy Resources, Committee for Migration and Employment, local self-governments, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Jogorku Kenesh, Committee on Taxes and Duties and the Ombudsman.

International organizations including UNAIDS, United Nations Population Fund, UNDP, “HelpAge International” and the World Bank are ready to provide support.

NGOs like “The Union of Good Forces”, “Public association for social protection of the population”, Councils of Labor Veterans, Wartime Workers and armed forces, and others shall take an active part in such activities. Mass media shall also participate in the seminar. Private sector organizations that are independent and different from the public, non-governmental and international organizations are Business Council, Bishkek Business Club and International Business Council that unite many businessmen of our country. The National Academy of Sciences of the KR, International Institute of Strategic Studies under the President of our country, Center for Public Technologies and experts are in charge of the research, forecasting and analysis.

The Committee on Ageing under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic shall be established to carry out this work. All these issues must be specified in relevant documents that should be agreed, approved and work in future despite the rotation of members of the group. A strategic plan on ageing shall also be developed. All measures undertaken by the non-governmental sector as well as those developed separately by the Ministry of Labor and Social Development should result in a major strategic plan on ageing. There must be accountability for the implementation of the plan. The reports should be mandatory published both in various mass media and in a separate document to be stored, archived and further distributed. This is the control and monitoring of functional responsibilities and the evaluation involving UN experts, international crediting organizations and NGOs.

The following resources are required:

Public funding. Personnel. Informational support to these initiatives. Appropriate infrastructure for implementing such initiatives. Investment and grants, sponsors and public organizations. A state order on informing the population.

Topic: Practical steps for concept and law implementation

- Improving the legislative base for the implementation of the concept and law. Developing regulations and social standard mechanisms.
- Improving and training professional staff such as health and social workers.
- Increasing salaries for social workers.
- Close relationships between all concerned ministries, non-governmental and public organizations in the course of implementing the above documents.
- Developing the information field.
- Restructuring the budget at various levels to ensure implementation of the documents.
- Creating a Consultative Council or a Working Group in each village council, rayon administration and city administration. This group should assess the carried out activities and hold public hearings.
- Promoting healthy lifestyle amongst older people.
- Round table discussions, open days, ensuring transparency of all activities to be carried out by the Working Group on the implementation of these two documents.

DAY 5: Plenary sessions included (1) “Resources within the UN system” by UNDESA, (2) “Next steps to promote the concept” and (3) “Agreement on Cooperation”.

Key information:

There is a need to continue cooperation at international level in order to improve the situation of older people in Kyrgyzstan. Having discussed the demographic situation on ageing in the KR as well as national policy priorities, the participants of the conference, consider that it is necessary to:

1. Speed up the elaboration of the concept and draft law, including ideas based on proposals developed by the participants of the conference, and ensure approval of these documents by the Parliament and Government of the KR.
2. Raise and allocate budgetary funds as required for implementation of the concept and draft law starting from January 2010.
3. Apply to international, governmental and non-governmental organizations as well as donors with concrete proposals and projects aimed at implementing the concept and draft law.

CONCLUSIONS:

1. There is a lack of public awareness on ageing related problems in Kyrgyzstan, especially in the remote highland areas.
2. State structures, specific NGOs and some businessmen deal with certain ageing aspects, however the extent of interaction and awareness of each other's activities is still inappropriate and leads to originating myths, on the one hand, and reducing the effectiveness of the existing resources, on the other hand.
3. The majority of the population views ageing as a natural process, which cannot be addressed. This has resulted in a high social status of older people, particularly in the south of the country, and poor infrastructure ensuring the support to health, socio-political and business activity of older people.
4. Kyrgyzstan, having joined the MIPAA, announced its intention to ensure a comprehensive approach to ageing problems. Several important state documents are currently being considered, which should ensure proper functioning of such an approach. The concept “Older Generation” and the draft law “About Older Citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic” are two basic documents the adoption of which would ensure resolution of a number of ageing problems at different levels of the state and society.
5. Enactment of the Law on State Social Order ensures the basis for the effective engagement of NGOs in providing a package of services for older people; however, its implementation requires close attention as this mechanism has not yet been fully developed.
6. Considerable attention is being paid by public bodies and charity organizations to the physical and socio-economic component of working with elderly people, although the activities on creating a sound moral and psychological atmosphere around older people are still limited.
7. Older people in Kyrgyzstan have an opportunity to utilize a variety of legislative acts including the Constitution of the KR in order to protect their rights; however the overwhelming majority of such acts should be analyzed in terms of their age sensitivity

and require revision. An important feature of older people is the low level of their legal awareness and literacy, which in its turn creates problems for law enforcement.

8. In some cases older people can enjoy the legal and other advice and services provided by government agencies and NGOs; however access to such services is restricted. It should be noted that due to similar physical and other restrictions, the assistance covers just a limited number of older citizens.
9. Empowerment and providing more opportunities to older people in Kyrgyzstan is achieved through self-help organizations (SHG and others). However, this method has its limitations due to poor infrastructure in the country, while the level of competition is very high.
10. National capacity for addressing ageing related problems is advanced, but it needs further strengthening. The number of organizations is too small for effective work in this field. Poor communication leads to duplication and overlapping. The limited number of segments covered by these organizations does not contribute to systemic addressing of ageing related problems in general and problems of elderly people in particular. Shortage of specialists in gerontology and geriatrics as well as specialists in other areas is becoming a real obstacle to the successful addressing of ageing related problems.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. There is a need for consolidating the information space. Various technologies that take into account specific perception of the population in different parts of the country should be used for this purpose, for example radio, traditional means of information transmission, etc.
2. Design and installation procedures for informing and interaction between different interest groups are one of the most important directions that ensure successful MIPAA implementation. In this sense it is necessary to form a common language and delineate the subject area.
3. It is important to deal with the perception of ageing. Age should not influence the attitude to human activities. For this purpose it is important to develop the infrastructure network in order to provide maximum possible number of services for older people. In this direction we may rely upon NGOs that need systemic technical (advisory) support.
4. For the purpose of successful promotion of legislative acts improving the situation in the field of ageing, it is necessary to intensify project activities in the public policy formats and procedures (coordination when designing and taking management decisions).
5. It is necessary to launch the activities on evaluating projects and programs, implementing laws, regulations and various solutions at national and local levels. An institutionalized network of NGOs able to carry out such assessments shall be established for this purpose.
6. There must be a shift from sensitive-tearful presentation of the old age in the information space to energetic presentation, ie. Demonstration of the successes achieved by various groups/organizations/countries through the participation of elderly people.
7. The problems of compliance with the established norms and implementation of the rights of older people shall be ensured through the development of a legal advice network, monitoring the activities of state bodies and other stakeholders. The network should include legal clinics and consultations set up by other projects. Legal assistance should be maximally adjusted to older people.
8. It is necessary to link the two project lines: multiplication of the experience on creating and developing self-help groups and creation of conditions for receiving technical assistance including advice on marketing, advertising, developing new technologies, etc.

9. It is necessary to support the creation and development of academic and research points for the purpose of achieving MIPAA priorities through opening gerontology and geriatrics departments, inclusion of specialized training curriculum into the staff training and retraining programs, etc.
10. Implementation of MIPAA priorities is directly linked to strengthening the capacity of public and private sector, which should pass joint systemic education. In this regard, the creation of conditions is crucial. The capacity shall be strengthened in several directions: institutional, technological, infrastructural, human, financial and others directions that would require considerable efforts on self-organization not only by the states, NGOs and businesses, but also by donors.

ACTIVITIES MATRIX

	Short-term perspective	Medium-term perspective	Long-term perspective
Raising public awareness	Informational strategy development and launch	Evaluation of the outcomes, technologies adjustment and transfer to the partners	Monitoring and evaluation of the outcomes, technical support
A comprehensive approach to ageing	Organization of communication on systemic approach to addressing the problems of ageing	Implementation of projects on lobbying the adoption of strategies etc.	Development and introduction of a system for monitoring and evaluating the implementation of strategies, programs, etc.
Empowering older people	Inventory of legislation, launching projects to expand legal opportunities for older people	Building infrastructural capacity of networks of organizations working with older people. Systematic communication with interest groups and donors	Establishing a think tank on ageing in Kyrgyzstan
Measures to strengthen national capacity	Developing a system of training (curricula and institutions) for organizations' staff working with elderly people. Learning the opportunities for the	Networking gerontological and geriatric services, departments, etc. Evaluation of a system of training and retraining of	Technical support to institutions on strengthening national capacity

	development of gerontology network and geriatric	organizations and specialists working with older people	
Activities results	Identifying opportunities and directions of activities on MIPAA implementation in Kyrgyzstan	Testing and “adjusting” the system for achieving the goals of working with elderly people	Sustainable system of work on addressing ageing problems in Kyrgyzstan

ANNEX 1 PROGRAMME OF THE SEMINAR

United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs in cooperation with the Ministry of Labor and Social Development of the KR

**Workshop on the National Policy and Legislation of Kyrgyzstan on Old People
Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan**

**Program
September 15-17, 2008**

Monday, September 15

“Priorities of the National Policy of Kyrgyzstan on Old People”

9:00 – 9:30 Registration of participants

Plenary session

9:30- 9:45 Opening of the workshop.

9:45 – 10:15 Welcoming speeches:

- **Elmira Sultanovna Ibraimova**, Vice Prime-Minister of the Kyrgyz Republic
- **Ukhtomkhan Avazovna Abdullaeva**, Minister of Labor and Social Development
- **Rosemary Lane**, United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs

10:15 – 10:45 Report “Madrid International Plan of Actions on Ageing” (MIPAA) and Course of Actions on the UNECE Regional Implementation Strategy

By Alexander Sidorenko

10:45 – 11:00 Implementation of the Madrid International Plan of Actions on Ageing in the Kyrgyz Republic. Social policy on support of old people. Role of the Ministry of Labor and Social Development of the Kyrgyz Republic in implementation of MIPAA in the Kyrgyz Republic.

Ukhtomkhan Avazovna Abdullaeva, Minister of Labor and Social Development of the Kyrgyz Republic

Q&A session, general discussion

11:00 – 11:30 **Coffee break**

Continuation of the plenary session

11:30 - 11:45 **Ageing problems in the Kyrgyz Republic: challenges and opportunities. Demographic situation. Comparative analysis of status of old people in the Kyrgyz Republic and in other Central Asian countries and CIS.**

Sergei Ivanovich Slepchenko – Director of the International Institute of Strategic Surveys, the Kyrgyz Republic

Addressing the problems of old people at the legislative level.

11:45 – 12 :00 **Gulnara Tolubaevna Derbisheva** – Deputy of the Legislative Assembly of Jogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyz Republic

12:00 – 12:15 **Damira Abaskanovna Niyazaieva** – Deputy of the Legislative Assembly of
of
Jogorku Kenesh of the Kyrgyz Republic

Activity of NGO in implementation of the Madrid Plan of Actions on Ageing

Svetlana Nikolaevna Bashtovenko – President of the Public Association “Resource Center for Elderly”

12:45 -13:00 Questions, answers

13:00 – 14:00 **Lunch**

14:00 – 15:30 Session in groups: **Priorities of the state policy with regard to old people in Kyrgyzstan:**

1 group - participation of old people in development

2 group – ensuring health and well-being in old age

3 group – ensuring favorable living conditions for old people

15:30 – 16:00	Coffee break
16:00 – 16:45	Continuation of the group work. Analysis of the situation on old people in the regions:
16:45 – 17:15	Plenary session Presentation of findings of the groups
17:15 - 17:30	Summary of results of the day – Alexander Sidorenko

Tuesday, September 16

Priorities of the state policy in regards to older people in the light of the MIPAA

9:00 – 9:15	Report on key elements of the previous day. Tasks of the current day. – Alexander Sidorenko
9:15 – 11:00	Work in three groups: Priorities of the state policy in regards to older people in Kyrgyzstan. Discussion of the second priority of MIPAA “Advancing Health and Well-being in old age”
11:00 – 11:30	Coffee break
11:30 – 13:00	General Plenary session: Presentation of findings of the groups and general discussion
13:00 – 14:00	Lunch
14:00 – 15:30	Session in working groups by regions: - development of measures for promotion of MIPAA in the regions considering three priority directions in the following formats: A) a set of measures to improve quality of life of old people in the field in inter-sector cooperation; B) local legislative initiatives
15:30 – 16:00	Coffee break
16:00 – 16:45	Working group discussions continue. Preparation of presentations.
16:45 - 17:00	Summary of results of the day – Alexander Sidorenko

Wednesday, September 17

“Development of tools of implementation of the main directions of the state social policy in relation to citizens of older generation”

- 9:00 – 9:15** Report on key elements of the previous day. Tasks of the current day -
Alexander Sidorenko
- 9:15 – 9:30** **Plenary session.**
New initiatives of the government and NGO in development of the policy on ageing.
Development of the Concept “Older Generation” and draft law “On Old Citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic”.

Baktybek Jekshenovich Jekshenov – Deputy Minister of Labor and Social Development of the Kyrgyz Republic, Chairman of the Working Group for Development of the Concept “Older Generation” and Law *On Old Citizens in the Kyrgyz Republic*
- 9:30 – 10:00** Annotation to the Concept “Older Generation” and the law “About Older Citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic”

Junushaliev Melis Turusbekovich – expert, the Center of Public Technologies
- 10:00 -10:30** **Plenary discussion. Q/A**
- 10:30 – 11:00** **Кофе брейк**
- 11:00-13:00** Work in three groups “Content and Mechanisms of implementing the main directions of the concept “Older Generation”
- problems and obstacles
- solutions
- 13:00 – 14:00** **Lunch**
- 14:00 - 15:00** General plenary discussion of findings of the groups. Discussion
- 15:00 – 15:30** **Coffee**
- 15:30 – 16:00** Wrap-up and closing of the workshop. Home tasks to read the two documents

Thursday, September 18

- 9:00 – 9:15** Report on key elements of the previous day. Tasks of the current day -

Alexander Sidorenko

9:15 -11:00	Plenary session. Discussion of the law “About Older Citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic”
11:00-11:30	Coffee
11:30-12:15	Plenary session. Implementing new initiatives on ageing in the Kyrgyz Republic: building national capacity. Essential elements of national capacity. (UNDESA)
12:15-12:30	Q/A
12:30-13:30	Lunch
13:30-15:30	Working in groups “Capacity to implement new initiatives (Concept and the Law) on ageing in the Kyrgyz Republic”. Analysis. Measures to strengthen national capacity on ageing in the country. <ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ National infrastructure: who are the major stakeholders (government, NGOs, academia, private sector)? How to coordinate national action on ageing?▪ What resources are needed to implement the Concept and the draft Law. Does KR have resources to implement the Concept and the draft Law? What measures are needed to improve the situation?▪ Practical measures to implement the Concept and the draft Law
15:30-16:00	Coffee
16:00-16:30	Closure of the day

Friday, September 19

9:00 – 9:15	Report on key elements of the previous day. Tasks of the current day - Alexander Sidorenko
9:15 -10:15	UNDESA presentation “Resources within the UN system”
10:15-11:00	Plenary session. “Next steps to promote the concept”. Discussion
11:00-11:30	Coffee
11:30-12:30	Plenary session. “Agreement on Cooperation”.
12:30-13:00	Evaluation and Closure.
13:00-14:00	Lunch
14:00 -15:00	DSA etc.

