Social Protection at the Local Level

Daniel Perell - NGO CSocD

What's in a name?

DSPD: Division for Social Policy and Development

DISD: Division for Inclusive Social Development

Shift from Policy to Inclusion
That's what I will do

Complexity

These past days we have discussed:

Economic Institutions   Taxes

Political Institutions   Multinationals

Governance   Robots and Ginis

Data Collection   Fertility

Culture   Wages

Fiscal Policy   Targeting

Need to rethink orthodoxy, as well: link between employment and health? Employment and wage? Political systems?

Nuance is required

Nuance can only be addressed through genuine conversation

… Inclusion …

What is Policy?

It is both the **substance**: what does it say?

And the **process**: how is it arrived at?

Inclusion comes up in both of these

Substantive and Process Inclusion

Substantive: Is the policy reaching the intended individuals?

Charity versus citizenship
Targeted versus universal

Process: Are the 'right' voices being heard at the formulation, implementation, and assessment stages of a policy?

What is development?

Historically, those 'with' are helping those 'without'
- The teacher giving knowledge to the student
- The wealthy giving money to the poor
- The knowledgeable giving know-how to the ignorant

But we know that development is a complex process, unresponsive to simple formulae that are based on raising income or the propagation of technological packages.

Development reframed

Development is building the capacity in individuals, communities and institutions to contribute effectively to processes that advance well-being

What is inclusion in this model? What is the role of the State? (Not absolved)

It is far more process-based. The substantive 'lessons learned' are suggestively important at the level of substance, but vital at the level of process.

What role for the UN? What role for this report?

Leadership

This is vital at the local level. Need not touch on corruption, except to say that it occurs at all levels. From policy making to resource allocation down to the implementation.

Traditional Leadership: Power over, a goal is to bend policy and action to a specific dogma

New leadership: understood as service, goal is to lift the capacity of others to engage

Specific Recomendations

1. Do not exclude any of the important factors which came before - data collection, wage policy, etc.
2. Pay significant attention to processes
   - Are those who are meant to benefit being included in the conversation?
   - If not, why? Do they feel empowered to engage, or are there barriers to entry (e.g. shame, perceived lack of knowledge)?
   - Initial attempts may be checklists, quotas - it may look tokenistic, but this may be the first step
   - If individuals are not included, how is the information shared?
   - When criticism arises, is the response defensive or humble?

Development as learning

Framing development efforts as elements of a learning process allows attention to be given not only to the identification of practical solutions, but also the attitudes, the will, and the dynamics that facilitate implementation.

Concerted action must in time lead to concrete results.

But in the initial stages of any process of learning, success may better be measured in terms of the the capacity for action being built - in the case of social protection, in the capacity of individuals, institutions and their communities to address development issues at progressively higher levels of complexity and effectiveness.

A few Examples

Behavior Change

Communities as protagonists (not solely recipients)

Unintended Consequences

Nutrition Education & Behavior Change

"stunting decreased only when transfers were combined with intensive behavioral change communication ... to change the household practices that drive nutrition status."

- Nutrition Education & Behavior Change Communication: How Much is "Enough" to Achieve Measurable Results for Nutrition in Social Protection Programs?, Andrea L. Spray

Communities as protagonists: CAR

Community schools in Central African Republic arose from a need to educate their children, but a lack of infrastructure and capacity from the state

Individuals came together and communities found teachers ("who here is literate?")

They found ways to compensate ("we will work your land while you teach our children")

Not well-received by the state at first (in 2003)

By 2011 there were 33 schools providing education to 2,800 children, extending support to seven countries working with 95 schools and over 5,000 children

In 2013, the CAR Ministry of Education officially recognized these schools

Unintended Consequences

Scheme was established to help women farmers receive funds in rural India

They were to establish a bank account and use mobile banking services

Required a minimum balance in the bank account, literacy in English, access to technology

In short, they required an intermediary - generally a man - who would then gain access to sensitive information.

The very program established to assist became a tool for possible exploitation

Conclusion

We are looking for quick policy fixes, but these issues are laden with nuance and complexity.

The substance will vary from place to place, but certain lessons are consistent:
1. The populations meant to be impacted have great capacity and should be treated as such
2. Participation of diverse populations in the articulation, implementation, and review of the policies is a universal necessity
3. The way in which policies and programs are modified in response to information matters