

PRIVATISATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN THE AGE OF GLOBALISATION

KOEN DE FEYTER
FELIPE GÓMEZ ISA
(EDS.)



University of
Deusto -

.

**Institute of
Human Rights
Pedro Arrupe**



Maastricht Centre for Human Rights



intersentia

Antwerp – Oxford

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE v

PRIVATISATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS: AN OVERVIEW

KOEN DE FEYTER and FELIPE GÓMEZ ISA 1

Human rights 2

State obligations 3

Private actors 5

International and domestic law 6

Economic globalisation 7

GLOBALISATION, PRIVATISATION AND HUMAN RIGHTS

FELIPE GÓMEZ ISA 9

1. Globalisation as a multidimensional process 10

2. Consequences of the current process of globalisation 13

 2.1. The reduction of the role of the state 13

 2.1.1. Privatisation and human rights 14

 2.2. The increasing role of transnational corporations 23

 2.3. The impact on cultural identities 25

3. The necessary globalisation of human rights 27

HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE PRIVATISATION OF PUBLIC UTILITIES AND ESSENTIAL SERVICES

COSMO GRAHAM 33

1. Scope of the paper: issues of definition 35

2. A human rights approach – Some preliminary issues 37

 2.1. Positive obligations 41

 2.2. Rights of access in national constitutions or human rights documents 42

 2.3. What is a public body? 43

3. Access to services in Britain 50

 3.1. Access to utility services 50

 3.2. Access to energy services 52

 3.3. Universal service in water 53

3.4. Universal service in telecommunications	55
4. Conclusions	55

**PRIVATISATION OF CORRECTIONS: A VIOLATION OF
U.S. DOMESTIC LAW, INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS,
AND GOOD SENSE**

IRA P. ROBBINS	57
1. Introduction	57
2. Advantages and criticisms	59
3. U.S. constitutional issues	63
3.1. State action	63
3.1.1. Public-function test	64
3.1.2. Close-nexus test	65
3.1.3. State-compulsion test	67
3.2. U.S. Supreme Court approach	68
3.3. Delegation	69
3.4. Other important legal and policy issues	72
4. International human rights violations	75
4.1. Staffing	76
4.2. Staff training and experience	79
4.3. Medical access	81
4.4. Prisoner programs	83
4.5. Specific populations: Juveniles and asylum seekers	85
4.6. Government responsibility	86
5. Symbolism: the hidden issue	88
6. Conclusion	89

**PRIVATISATION, PRISONS, DEMOCRACY AND HUMAN
RIGHTS: THE NEED TO EXTEND THE PROVINCE OF
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW**

ALFRED C. AMAN, JR.	91
1. Introduction	91
2. The democracy problem	96
3. State centric and denationalised aspects of globalisation	100
4. Delegations to the market	103
4.1. Privatisation	103
4.2. Private prisons	105
4.3. Regulating private prisons: Towards a model statute	107
4.3.1. Privatisation, cost, democracy and inequality	108

4.3.2. Minorities in prison	111
4.4. Private prisons – Transparency and accountability	112
4.5. The outer limits of privatisation and prisons	119
4.5.1. Disciplinary hearings	119
4.5.2. Exporting inmates	120
4.5.3. Privatisation of interrogation during wartime	122
5. Conclusion	125

SOCIAL PROTECTION IS A MATTER OF HUMAN RIGHTS: EXPLORING THE ICESCR RIGHT TO SOCIAL SECURITY IN THE CONTEXT OF GLOBALISATION

LUCIE LAMARCHE	129
1. Introduction	129
2. From the right to social security “ <i>stricto sensu</i> ” to the right to social protection	131
2.1. Social security ‘ <i>stricto sensu</i> ’	132
2.1.1. Protected classes of persons	135
2.1.2. The level of benefits	135
2.1.3. Choice of social security systems	136
2.2. Social security in trouble: the globalisation era	138
2.3. Social security that includes “other workers”: a first yield for the ILO’s work	142
2.4. Social security as a component of social protection: a second yield for the ILO’s work	144
3. The requirements of the human right to social protection: the obligations of state and non-state actors in the context of globalisation	148
3.1. Poverty as a human rights issue and the right to social protection: does it walk the talk?	149
3.1.1. Poverty and human rights	149
3.1.2. The ICESCR and poverty	152
3.1.3. ICESCR and the right to social security and to social protection	157
3.2. Putting the state back in social protection’s issues: ... and who else?	163
3.3. Back to basics: monitoring the violation of the human right to social protection and to social security	168
3.3.1. Positive obligations of the state parties to the ICESCR as an obligation of means	168
3.3.2. Positive obligations of the state parties to the ICESCR as an obligation of results	169

3.3.3. The minimal content of the right to social security	170
4. Conclusion	172

SOCIAL RIGHTS AND PRIVATISATION: LESSONS FROM THE ARGENTINE EXPERIENCE

CHRISTIAN COURTIS	175
1. The social security reform process: the struggle between tradition and privatisation	176
1.1. The inherited situation	176
1.2. Winds of privatisation	178
1.3. The aftermath: how the new system was implemented	182
1.4. Was there any role for a 'social rights' discourse in the whole reform process?	187
2. Some successful challenges of market-oriented reforms	195
2.1. The 'Social Security Solidarity Act' under judicial challenge	195
2.2. The case of worker's compensation for injury and occupational disease	198
2.3. Privatisation retirees' health insurance	200
2.4. The challenge of market-oriented reforms regarding water services in Argentine provinces	201
3. Brief conclusions	203

IS PRIVATISATION OF HEALTH CARE A HUMAN RIGHTS PROBLEM?

M. GREGG BLOCHE	207
1. Medical care and the right to health	208
2. Privatisation of medical care – some oft-voiced concerns	212
2.1. What is health care privatisation?	212
2.2. Privatisation and austerity	214
2.3. Privatisation and ability to pay. Health as a merit good	217
2.4. The commodification problem	219
2.5. The accountability problem	221
3. A qualified endorsement for privatisation	225
4. Conclusion	227

PRIVATISATION OF EDUCATION AND THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION

FONS COOMANS and ANTENOR HALLO DE WOLF	229
1. Introduction	229
2. The content of the right to education as a human right	230
2.1. The scope and meaning of Article 13 ICESCR	230
2.2. The core content of the right to education	231
2.2.1. The 'core content' concept	231
2.2.2. Elements of the core content of the right to education	232
2.3. A typology of obligations relating to the implementation of the right to education	237
2.4. Some observations on the relationship between privatisation and violations of obligations resulting from the right to education	239
3. Privatisation of education: definition of means	241
3.1. Methods of education privatisation	243
3.1.1. Privatisation of education through alternative funding	244
3.1.2. Privatisation of education through the delegation of school management and instructional services ..	246
3.1.3. Privatisation of education through the delegation of regulation and monitoring	250
3.2. Liberalisation in trade in services and education privatisation	250
4. Analysis of potential human rights issues	253
5. Concluding remarks	256

PRIVATISATION AND THE RIGHT TO ACCESS TO WATER

ANTON KOK	259
1. Introduction	259
2. Establishing a right to water at international level	259
3. International human rights documents and privatisation	263
4. National constitutions and privatisation	263
5. Privatisation as it relates to access to water	264
6. Establishing the accountability of the state and private parties ..	267
6.1. International level	267
6.2. National level	268
6.3. Remedies	272

6.3.1. 'Sufficient' water	272
6.3.2. 'Access' to water	274
6.3.3. Progressive realisation	277
6.3.4. 'Respect, protect, promote and fulfil'	278
6.3.5. An argument based on unfair discrimination/ equality	282
7. Conclusion	286

**INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AND NATURAL RESOURCES UNDER
THE INTER-AMERICAN SYSTEM OF HUMAN RIGHTS.
BETWEEN PRIVATISATION AND THE EXERCISE OF
HUMAN RIGHTS**

MIKEL BERRAONDO LÓPEZ	289
1. Privatisation, indigenous peoples and human rights	289
2. Natural resources in the context of privatisation and indigenous peoples	299
3. Indigenous property rights concerning resources: new spaces of privatization in the inter-American context of human rights	312
4. Conclusion	322

NOTE ON CONTRIBUTORS	325
----------------------------	-----